

Peer Review

Review of: "Climate and Environmental Changes: Reflections and Prospects for the Future of the Mediterranean Area — Food Security and Climate Change: Agricultural Considerations"

Masoomeh Shamsabad¹

1. University of Agriculture in Krakow, Kraków, Poland

Feedback and Suggested Edits

Dear Germana Borsetta,

The content provides a comprehensive overview of climate-smart agriculture (CSA) practices in the Mediterranean region, but certain sections could benefit from improved clarity, organization, and specificity.

Comments have been added in the PDF file. Also, below are recommendations for enhancing the text:

1. Structure and Flow:

- **Current Structure:** The text covers multiple ideas (e.g., policy recommendations, CSA benefits, soil management, stakeholder involvement) but lacks a clear progression. Consider breaking the content into subsections with headings like "CSA Benefits," "Policy Recommendations," "Soil Management Practices," and "Stakeholder Engagement."
- **Flow Improvement:** Rearrange the information to introduce challenges first, followed by CSA solutions, policy needs, and finally the role of consumers.

2. Clarity and Precision:

- Some phrases are repetitive or vague, e.g., "Policies related to sustainable development and climate change mitigation require a bottom-up approach to be effective and replicable." This can be streamlined to avoid redundancy.

- Use specific examples or case studies to illustrate abstract points, such as "targeted interventions to reduce the risk of failure."

3. Technical Details:

- The section on soil management is very specific but lacks context. Why are these practices particularly relevant to the Mediterranean? Mention unique soil challenges in the region, such as desertification or salinization.
- Clarify how the equation "CSA = Sustainable Agriculture + Resilience – Emissions" applies practically and connect it to examples from the Mediterranean.

4. Stakeholder Engagement:

- While the text emphasizes inclusivity, it could benefit from specifying how stakeholders like women and youth are currently excluded and how CSA initiatives could overcome these barriers.
- Mention successful examples of stakeholder participation in CSA initiatives in the Mediterranean.

5. Role of Climate Information Services:

- Expand on how climate information services can be implemented effectively in the region. Provide examples or pilot programs demonstrating their utility.

6. Role of Consumers:

- Highlight specific actions consumers can take to support CSA, such as choosing locally produced goods or supporting climate-resilient supply chains.
- Add examples of successful consumer-driven initiatives in the Mediterranean.

7. Language Improvements:

- Replace terms like "difficult realities" with more precise language, such as "complex challenges."

Revised Example Section

Current Version:

The increasing instability in Mediterranean countries, particularly in the agricultural sector, requires targeted interventions to reduce the risk of failure in climate change-related projects. The main limitations to the adoption of sustainable practices lie in difficulties accessing credit, short-term production declines (even when long-term production may increase), investment risks during transition, a lack of information, knowledge, and skills, insufficient funding and appropriate policies,

a lack of participation in decision-making processes, a lack of cooperation with the research community, and, not least, a lack of trust in the system and innovation.

Suggested Revision:

The growing instability in Mediterranean countries, particularly within the agricultural sector, highlights the urgent need for targeted interventions to mitigate risks associated with climate change projects. Key barriers to adopting sustainable practices include limited access to credit, initial declines in productivity during the transition period, and heightened investment risks. Additional challenges stem from insufficient funding, inadequate policies, and a lack of access to information, technical expertise, and training. Furthermore, limited stakeholder engagement in decision-making processes, weak collaboration with the research community, and mistrust in innovation exacerbate these issues. Addressing these barriers requires a coordinated approach, combining financial incentives, capacity building, and robust policy frameworks tailored to regional needs.

Regards,

Masoomesh Shemshad (Dr.)

Attachments: available at <https://doi.org/10.32388/02FMFI>

Declarations

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.