

Review of: "Public Health Care Leadership Competencies Through the Lens of the COVID-19 Pandemic: A Review of What Matters in Managing Global Health Crisis"

Sonia Udod¹

¹ University of Manitoba

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Summary of Paper

Thank you for the opportunity to review this manuscript on public health care leadership competencies.

Overall, this paper could be an important addition to the health care literature in the context of healthcare crises. Health leaders need strategies to shape their leadership competencies in a crisis. I provide the following feedback to strengthen the paper.

The major issue I see is that although this is articulated as a scoping review the author does not use a scoping review framework to guide the process and includes a review of crisis leadership frameworks. I suggest following a scoping review process using Arksey and O'Malley (2005) (see Belrhiti et al, 2018 as an example of a scoping review). Kotter's change framework is used for planned change (linear change model) but the crisis was unpredictable (non-linear change model) and more in line with chaos theory as an example of a non-linear change. I am not familiar with the Fusion Cell Approach. The LEADS framework is an interesting model that has received considerable support. The framework was founded by Dickson and Tholl, and not the Community Health Nurses of Canada.

The Methodology needs to reflect a scoping review methodology (see Belrhiti et al).

The Discussion sounds reasonable, but statements need to be aligned with referencing articles from the scoping review. This can help readers determine the trustworthiness of your scoping review. There was also a sense that some statements went beyond health care leaders and into non health related institutions. While I understand there was interdependency between health and government, from my perspective, this created additional ambiguity and lack of clarity.

Consider explaining how, for example, evolutionary transformation looks like-how can health leaders innovate? Can you say more about EI and how leaders can use EI as a health leader? The communication themes contained specific strategies (content accuracy, symbols, language) but what are comprehensive signs and how did culture promote effective communication?

Referencing will need to be reviewed to ensure it aligns with the journal's referencing management system. Good luck!

