

# Review of: "A Literature Review on the Levels of Toxic Metals/Metalloids in Meat and Meat Products in Asian Countries: Human Health Risks"

Hamid Ullah<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Chemistry, BUIITEMS, Quetta, Pakistan

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

## **Reviewer comments:**

The manuscript by Domingo J L., titled "A Literature Review on the Levels of Toxic Metals/Metalloids in Meat and Meat Products in Asian Countries: Human Health Risks," discusses a topic of wide interest to the general population worldwide and is a highly relevant and timely topic for the Qeios Journal. The manuscript presents a compilation of the literature about the Levels of Toxic Metals/Metalloids in Meat and Meat Products in Asian Countries: Human Health Risks. However, while the topic is indeed important and relevant to the journal's readership, the article requires several modifications and corrections before it can be considered for publication. These revisions would strengthen the scientific arguments, knowledge, and ensure the paper meets the standards for publication. Below is the detailed summary of the issues that need to be addressed by the authors.

1. General comments on the review article: The manuscript lacks the design, collection of the data, presentation of the data, and critical discussion. The authors fail to identify the key knowledge gaps and areas in order to provide future research directions and management of the issues caused by the consumption of contaminated foods. The methods applied for data collection, like PubMed, may provide data in graphical form, which should be included in this manuscript. Some sentences are overly complex and may hinder comprehension. The organization and structure of the paper should be improved by addressing the comments given in the specific comments section.

Specific comments section-wise:

### **1. Abstract:**

Although the abstract reflects the summary of the topic, it is poorly designed and lacking a complete reflection of the topic presented in the manuscript. The background sentences are weak and do not set an attractive/strong background for the need for the topic to be presented in the form of a review article. The sentences have poor consistency, connectivity, and are less appealing. The English in this section is poor. Abbreviations like IARC should be avoided; rather, a complete word should be written for the first time. The whole abstract needs to be redesigned with respect to science. Additionally, the abstract contains grammatical, typographical, and spelling errors. A thorough proofreading of the abstract is needed.

### **1. Introduction:**

The introduction sets a good background for the presented research under the selected title; however, strong statements in support of the need for the publication of the current topic are lacking in various paragraphs of this section. Additionally, in order to make this section more attractive and provide an overview of all the next sections of this review article, an informational abstract should be provided.

## 1. Analytical methods to measure metals/metalloids in meat and meat products

This section is very roughly presented. The sentences have no connectivity with each other and do not address the purpose of this section. Except for the last few sentences, the whole paragraph of this section is written with no clear meaning. This section should be presented with proper English and scientific evidence from the literature. The whole section is written without a single citation. Appropriate citations must be added to this section.

### 1. Concentrations of metals/metalloids in meat and meat products consumed in Asian countries

In this section, the author collected a good amount of literature data, but it is presented very poorly. The sentence structure is not good; the majority of the data is presented in the form of parenthesis. Only one table for the data from China is given with remarks, which is appreciable, but the remarks lack critical aspects. Some of the remarks merely describe the source and pathway of the selected metals/metalloids. The data from the rest of the countries in Asia can also be summarized in table form, which can help in the quick reading of the topic presented. The discussion has been separated from this section and was presented along with the conclusion section, which makes this section merely a collection of data. Therefore, substantial modification is needed in this section by addressing the issues discussed above.

1. **Discussion and Conclusion:** The discussion and conclusion section is roughly presented, and the contents of this section, as well as the sentence structures, are so poor that they cannot convey the information required to be conveyed to the readers in this section. In some areas, the authors wrote that it is a review article merely for presenting literature data and does not need any discussion. In the last paragraph, the authors wrote that many papers published about the topic from Asian countries are not written in English, from which it can be inferred that the authors have not included data from such papers. Such papers mostly have an abstract in English at least and may be converted into their translated form for citation and understanding. The conclusion, overall, is not clear. Based on these observations, the authors are suggested to redesign and rewrite this section with a clear part for discussion, conclusion, limitations, and future recommendations.
2. The human health risk is a part of this manuscript, as mentioned in the title, but in the manuscript, appropriate correlation of the metals with human health and discussion about this part of the topic is missing.
3. The authors should properly justify the scope of this article.
4. The authors need an in-depth revision of the grammar, and an improvement in the English language is recommended.
5. **References:** The referencing style in the bibliography lacks consistency and uniformity. This issue must be addressed. Additionally, it is suggested that further papers be cited to make the manuscript more complete.

