Review of: "Indian Digital Library Initiatives"

Sanjoy Kar

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

The article presents a thorough examination of digital library initiatives in India, including an analysis of their current status and recommendations for improvement. The paper highlights various crucial issues that require attention, such as inadequate digitized collections, non-standardized metadata, lack of proper search interfaces, and the absence of global standards. The paper also provides valuable policy suggestions for enhancing the situation. However, the paper would benefit from additional primary research to supplement the secondary data gathered from websites. Moreover, the paper could offer a more critical analysis of government digital library usage statistics since higher usage statistics do not necessarily indicate better-functioning digital libraries. In general, the paper offers valuable new insights into the current state of digital libraries in India.

The paper shows that the authors have a good understanding of the relevant literature in the field by citing various literature sources. It also highlights a gap in the literature, which is the absence of a significant study on digital library initiatives that covers the entirety of India. However, the abstract only mentions a few articles in the field, and it is unclear if any significant work has been overlooked. The author could enhance the paper by conducting a more thorough and critical analysis of the relevant literature, particularly on digital libraries in India. Additionally, it could explore how its findings relate to existing literature and theories on digital libraries. Although the literature review is satisfactory, further refinement and exploration of the literature could strengthen the paper.

The methodology used in the paper seems appropriate and well-designed as it is a survey of digital library initiatives in India that collected secondary information from approximately fifty digital libraries through their respective websites. The appendix provides a detailed sample, which includes a variety of major digital libraries, such as academic, government, and other types of libraries, accessed over a four-month period. The sample covers different regions of India and different types of libraries, which allows for a comprehensive overview. However, it is unclear whether any quality control measures were taken to ensure the accuracy and reliability of the secondary information gathered from websites. Additionally, the paper could benefit from a more precise description of the methods employed.

The paper presents clear and concise findings regarding the state of digital libraries in India. The authors have identified significant issues such as the lack of proper search interfaces, maintenance, and remote access facilities that affect these libraries. They also pointed out that most digital libraries in India do not have their own standards or are not following global standards. However, the authors could have conducted a more detailed analysis of usage statistics of the digital libraries surveyed. They have mentioned that government libraries have better usage statistics, but failed to provide additional evidence to support this claim. Furthermore, the authors could have discussed the potential implications of the issues identified, such as the impact on education and research in India. Overall, the findings are presented clearly, and
the analysis is insightful, although the paper could benefit from a more in-depth analysis of some aspects of the findings.

The authors intend to evaluate digital library initiatives based on various parameters, including digital collections, software used for retrieval, usage statistics, copyright issues, social media presence, remote access facilities, and geographical location. However, the authors did not provide clear identification of the implications for research, practice, and society. The paper does not offer recommendations for improving the issues faced by digital libraries in India. It also limits the study to digital libraries accessible through websites and excludes physical digital libraries. The survey methodology is explained in detail, and a comprehensive list of sample digital libraries is provided, making it easier for other researchers to replicate the study. Although the paper provides valuable insights into the current state of digital libraries in India, it would be beneficial to focus on implications for research, practice, and society in greater detail.