

Review of: "Stock Estimation Trial From Spatio-temporal Limited Data of Six Commercial Species in the Middle Madeira River, Southwest Amazon"

Jongkar Grinang

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

This study estimates the stock of six commercial fish species from the middle Madeira River. The research is scientifically meritorious, which provides useful fisheries data for managing fish stock in the region. Although the title has been revised from the original (which takes into consideration the limited data), one particular determining factor for fish stock in a marine ecosystem, water temperature, needs to be included in the model (I think the data can be obtained from the department of meteorology/hydrology, which has annual data at stations proximate to this study site). The catchability is always associated with water temperature, with the behaviour of different species responding differently. Using individuals as a parameter for the model is a good adjustment from other approaches; however, the biomass would provide more insight into the stock directly. In this sense, the methods for collecting fish need to be standardized (i.e., efforts - board size, mesh size, manpower). I understand the limitations of using fish landing data because the overall fishing activity is not designed according to the research framework. Therefore, I suggest the authors improve the write-up of the paper to take into consideration of this limitation and to minimize the error of interpretation of the results. Best wishes.