

Review of: "The Effect of Regulation on the Degree of Implementation of the Social Tariff in the Water and Sanitation Sector"

Seiya Maki¹

¹ National Institute for Environmental Studies

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Although the manuscript is interesting, some parts appear to be incompletely explained. In addition, the use of colloquial expressions such as "unique data" in the text as a whole makes it difficult to understand the meaning clearly. Some terms, such as "norm," are used with different meanings in other parts of the paper, which seems to lack one definition. I think that you should improve these parts.

Though I think the focus of this paper is important, there have been many studies of econometric analysis of tap water services. I think that the importance of this paper in this study is not adequately explained in this context. From the content of the manuscript, I think it is important to mention that the analysis is targeted at Brazil. I think it would be better to use a writing style that emphasizes these parts more.

Abstract

The abstract is about 110 words. Many papers can add up to 200-300 words, so you should describe your paper, including more details. Many readers would decide whether to read the main manuscript or not after checking the abstract.

Author

In many papers, the organization is commonly written up to the departmental affiliation. Please check when you submit your paper.

2.1 Social tariff

It is not clear to readers outside the country whether "Arsae-MG" is a company that covers the overall Brazilian market or not. Many readers think that regional differences may be a major factor, since Brazil is a large country. The coverage of data sources is also important for the analysis; please provide an explanation that readers not familiar with the Brazilian situation could understand.

The meaning of "Social Tariff-Water" and "Standard Tariff-Water" is not clear from the explanation in the manuscript. The definitions need to be explained clearly because water tariffs are different in each country and region. Are these two tariffs common categories in Brazil?

2.2 Regulation and inspections

P.12 "In November 2021, ~ the agency previously" does not provide the specific period of time for which the observation data was obtained. You should explain the specific period of observation and the type of data.

Equations (2)-(4)

The "

$$DIST_{it}$$

" on the left-hand side is different for each formula, thus it is better to use different symbols to clearly differentiate among them.

There are 2 type coefficients,

$$D$$

and

$$\beta$$

, which are obtained in statistical analysis. I think they are dummy variables and coefficients of sequential values, but these definitions must be described here.

Tabel.5-6

In this paper, "Std. Error" is used, but in most econometric papers, "p-value" is used that the significance could be easily understood by the reader.

Why did you use "Std. Error"?