

Review of: "Toxicological evaluation of aqueous extracts of *Clematis hirsuta* and *Rhamnus prinoides*"

Christine Robert Da Silva¹

¹ Université de la Réunion

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

In this article, the authors assess the possible toxic properties of 2 plants commonly used in traditional medicine in Asia and Africa. Decoctions are given to animals and the acute and sub-acute toxicity is evaluated.

Can the authors be more accurate on the following points :

Origin of the plant : It is known that the composition (quantity and quality) of metabolites can vary according to altitude, harvesting period and environmental conditions. Can the authors specify whether these factors have an influence on composition? Or the exact location (GPS coordinates) and time of year of harvest.

Preparation of medicinal plant extracts : "the traditional method of decoction preparation" : how long? with or without stirring?

Extracts are freeze-dried and stored at -20°C until use. In which solvent are the extracts recovered?

Why did you choose to freeze-dry the extracts and not give the filtered decoctions directly?

Concentrations are expressed as mg/mL, does it mean : mg of lyophilized extracts or mg of plant material?

Animal experiments : authors have chosen to use female rats. Why female? Why not male or both?

Do the concentrations given to animals correspond to the quantities usually consumed by people?

Body weight gain : the weight gain could be due to a stimulation of insulin production. It would have been interesting to measure insulin level.

No toxic effect have been detected during this experience. In the population, the consumption of such medicine plants

People consume herbal tea over a very long period of time. What are the long-term effects on the liver and kidneys? Are there any studies showing the potential toxic effects of these plants in the general population?