Review of: "Stock Estimation Trial From Spatio-temporal Limited Data of Six Commercial Species in the Middle Madeira River, Southwest Amazon"

Felipe Polivanov Ottoni[1]

1 Federal University of Maranhão

Recommendation on the manuscript "Estimating the Fish Stocks of Six Commercial Species in the Middle Madeira River, Southwest Amazon"

After carefully reading the manuscript, my recommendation is "Major revision."

I have made several suggestions and corrections directly in the MS PDF file. However, I'm listing my main comments below:

1. Unfortunately, I'm not a native English speaker, nor a professional translator. But, in my opinion, the English language of the manuscript needs a revision. Therefore, I suggest that the English language of the manuscript should be proofread by a professional translator or a native English speaker. In addition, the name of the English language reviewer must be presented in the acknowledgments section.
2. See my suggestions on the MS title and abstract.
3. You repeated in the Keywords section some words (e.g., fish stocks, Madeira River) that are already in the title. This is not recommended, since it reduces the search power of your paper. I suggest changing these repeated words.
4. In the introduction section, as well as in the discussion section, you should address the topic "freshwater biodiversity crisis" and why your work is important to face this global phenomenon. I suggest to you the following up-to-date references on the subject:

Ottoni FP, South J, Azevedo-Santos VM, Henschel E and de Bragança PHN (2023), Editorial: Freshwater biodiversity crisis: Multidisciplinary approaches as tools for conservation. Front. Environ. Sci. 11:1155608. doi: 10.3389/fenvs.2023.1155608

Tickner, D., Opperman, J. J., Abell, R., Acreman, M., Arthington, A. H., Bunn, S. E., et al. (2020). Bending the curve of global freshwater biodiversity loss: An Emergency Recovery Plan. BioScience 70 (4), 330–342. doi:10.1093/biosci/biaa002

Reid, A. J., Carlson, A. K., Creed, I. F., Eliason, E. J., Gell, P. A., Johnson, P. T., et al. (2019). Emerging threats and persistent conservation challenges for freshwater biodiversity. Biol. Rev. 94 (3), 849–87394. doi:10.1111/brv.12480

Albert, J. S., Destouni, G., Duke-Sylvester, S. M., Magurran, A. E., Oberdorff, T., Reis,

R. E., et al. (2020). Scientists' warning to humanity on the freshwater biodiversity crisis.

Ambio 50, 85–94. doi:10.1007/s13280-020-01318-8

1. Recently, a paper (Santos et al., 2023) was published arguing about the lack of information on fishing stocks under exploitation in Brazil and the lack of a system of continuous fishing monitoring and its effects on the fisheries sustainability in the country. You must mention this paper in the introduction and discussion sections of your MS.

SANTOS, J.P., GUIMARÃES, E.C., GARCIOV-FILHO, E.B., BRITO, P.S., LOPES, D.F.C., ANDRADE, M.C., OTTONI, F.P., DIAS, L.J.B.S., ANJOS, M.R., CARVALHO-NETA, R.N.F., RODRIGUES, L.R.R., Nogueira, M.A.M.P., PELICICE, F.M., AGOSTINHO, A.A., FEARNSIDE, P.M. Fisheries monitoring in Brazil: How can the 2030 agenda be met without fisheries statistics? Biota Neotropica 23(2): e20221439. https://doi.org/10.1590/1676-0611-BN-2022-1439

1. The introduction and discussion sections of your MS were organized in several paragraphs, which are related to each other. In my opinion, you should reorganize these paragraphs, forming larger and more cohesive paragraphs.
2. A map of the locality, including the monitoring station, would be welcome.
3. You must include the author and year of publication of the species and genera when you mention them for the first time in the text, except in the abstract.
4. I suggest that authors should include a plate including one photograph of a specimen of each species studied here. Not every reader is familiar with these species.

This review is not anonymous, and the authors may contact me if they have any questions.

All the best,

Felipe Ottoni