

Review of: "Scintigraphic and histopathologic evaluation of the protective effect of L-carnitine on the development of radiation-induced kidney damage in infant rats"

Abdul S. Ansari

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

In the present manuscript the author(s) evaluated the protective effect of L-carnitine on radiation induced nephropathy in immature rats. One month old rats were one time irradiated @8 Gy with or without pre-treatment of L-carnitine @ 300 mg/kg, i.p. and observed after three months for scintigraphic and histopathologic evaluation of nephropathy. It was concluded that the radiotherapy prior to treatment of L-carnitine resulted into longer survival of animals with partially protection of kidney damage. The manuscript is written with appropriate rationale but without sound English, loosely and haphazardly written, thus, required re-written of the manuscript taking care of all Instructions.

It may be accepted by taking care of all points after revision.

General comments:

Since the present study was conducted after weaning of animals, therefore, it is appropriate to use the term "immature rats" instead of "infant rats".

The study conducted to observe radiation induced nephropathy (RIN). This terminology has to be used throughout the manuscript.

Specific comments:

Title:

The title of the manuscript requires to slight modification as "Scintigraphic and histopathologic evaluation for the protective effect of L-carnitine on radiation induced nephropathy in immature rats".

Abstract:

Modify the Abstract by taking care of all results and modification done.

Change Running Title and Keywords as suggested.

Introduction:

Modify the Introduction as suggested.

Write all quoted references enclosed in a single large parentheses [], as follows: When there is two references, instead of [2][3] write [2,3] in superscript. When there are three or more references are quoted in continuation, write them [1-4].

Likewise, if references are quoted haphazardly like [25][42][43][44] then follow the pattern [25, 42-44].

Materials and Methods:

Modify the write-up as per suggestions.

All points/sub-headings and text have to be same as present in Results.

How many rats are housed in a single cage, also mention cage size?

Separate description without repetition required for static DMSA cortical kidney scintigraphy and DTPA dynamic kidney scintigraphy.

Imaging has done in situ then in write-up use of anesthesia is required.

What happened with right kidney?

Results:

Modify the write-up as per suggestions.

The write-up related to Survival has to be shifted prior to Scintigraphy.

Discussion:

Rewrite the Discussion in the light of (i) Problem of nephropathy after radiotherapy in kidney cancer patients, (ii) Discuss results with already available literature, and (iii) Role of L-carnitine in amelioration of kidney nephropathy due to radiotherapy.

References:

Format all references according to Instructions to Authors.

Delete Additional References.

Remove ^, a, b,c, etc. symbols from the references and again format.

Tables:

Number all Tables with Roman number as 1, 2, 3, etc.

Delete irrelevant Table 3.

Modify captions/legends of Tables.

Table 2: Add data related to Right, DTPA, Max and Right, DTPA, T $\frac{1}{2}$.

Figures:

Figures 2-5 should be in a single plate with similar magnification for comparison.

Magnification bar can be inserted for better depiction of magnification of structure.

If the higher magnification of a specific region of interest is essential then the same can be inserted as inset/superimposed at the corner of the main photograph.

The scan copy of the manuscript with suggested corrections and/incorporation has enclosed to facilitate the authors.