Review of: "A Research Note on Natural Reclamation Processes that Support Mangrove Biodiversity Spheres: Sedimentation in Three Major River Deltas in Northwestern Luzon Using Aerial Imagery"

Radhika Bhargava[1]

1 National University of Singapore

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

The overall language is non-academic and reads like a blog. I am not sure if that is the nature of the article in this publication.

The introduction needs to convey the research question. It is written in essay format with interesting material in the introduction, but the author can help readers to situate the research in the literature in the introduction section.

Methods

Define the Macro, Meso, and Micro scales and explain how the methods address these scales.

The author claims that the standard fieldwork in mangroves performed by researchers globally regularly is a “limitation” by saying, “wading through the brackish water environment which entails at times getting into waist-deep water since the legs will sink into the mud, not to mention that the lower limb tends to stick to the mud once it sinks into the mud”

I think this is not the right attitude to convey in a research article and I urge them to think of a more practical research limitation than presenting mangrove fieldwork as a limitation.

Please discuss how/if an accuracy assessment was performed.

Please discuss the issue of working with datasets of different scales, i.e. 1:50000 for historical data versus 2 meters for WorldView.

What is the logic for comparing with 2013 when more updated WorldView images are available?

Throughout the paper, vague sentences such as “The Worldview 2 satellite has the coastal blue band (band 1) which is quite useful in such analysis of sedimentation” are used. This does not help in understanding what was “quite useful”.

Conclusion

The conclusion is non-comprehensive and doesn’t help in understanding what the real contribution of this article is. I commend the paper for performing historical analysis and the maps are helpful in seeing the new land formations and

colonization with mangroves. But, the author can go beyond by performing accuracy assessment analysis, performing remote sensing to understand species diversity, NDVI, as an example to enhance the findings.