

Peer Review

Review of: "The Mediterranean Islands: Demographic Convergences and Divergences, 1995–2021"

Jan Petzold¹

1. Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München, Germany

This paper brings together rich demographic data and extensive statistical analysis of Mediterranean island regions. In principle, its relevance lies in the socio-economic challenges European islands face and the relative lack of research and political attention on them.

However, the paper has several shortcomings:

- It lacks a clear problem statement and justification for why this research is relevant, including reference to research on Mediterranean island challenges.
- The title and abstract imply that the paper is about Mediterranean islands and islandness. However, first of all, the study is about certain island regions within the Mediterranean (NUTS2 - which are mainly archipelagos and not individual islands), and, secondly, the paper does not discuss "islandness" or define what is meant by that.
- The paper extensively reports on different clusters related to specific demographic issues of interest. It would also be insightful to describe certain island clusters more qualitatively. What makes them distinct? What do they share? What "types" of islands do they represent?
- In some parts, there is reference to analysing geographic, cultural, political, economic, and social environments. However, the actual analysis solely relies on demographic data.
- Related to the point above, also the hypotheses in the discussion/conclusion on potential "agents"/factors that affect the demography of the islands (archipelagos) are not backed up by any literature or references that can support the hypotheses.

By providing more context and more positioning of the findings in discussions on island development, the paper could make a relevant contribution to the field.

Declarations

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.