Review of: "The Impact of Urban Design in minimizing Women's Fear of Crime"

Ahmed Elkhateeb[1]

1 Ain Shams University

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

This review has been written by: **Doaa Kamal Eldin Hassan** and **Ahmed Elkhateeb**

Introduction and Literature Review

The paper discusses the impact of urban design on crime and fear of crime, especially for women. It argues that the design of public spaces can influence the likelihood of crime and the perception of safety. The paper reviews the concepts of Situational Crime Prevention (SCP) and Crime Prevention through Environmental Design (CPTED), which are two approaches to crime prevention that focus on the design of the physical environment. However, the paper lacks the following:

- The research title did not mention it is a local study carried out in India.
- Also, this point should be mentioned clearly in the beginning of the research to show locality.
- The logic behind selecting these only approaches in design to prevent crime.
- Table (2-1) that summarizes the previous studies did not show solid results that act as a base for this research. I mean the gap analysis and pointing the missed issues.
- The research lacks an in-depth analysis to previous similar studies.

Keywords

"Safety and security" and related theories are very relevant to such research. Nevertheless, the author did not mention them appropriately.

Methodology

The research methodology depends only on a questionnaire, and I believe such qualitative research needs to be validated by other tools to consolidate the results, such observation, interviews with professionals, . . .etc.

Also, the author did not show the questions of the questionnaire and their aims to show how it was built to serve the research goal. The link to "Sample of Questionnaire" does not work.

Results

The paper then presents the results of a survey of 320 women in urban and peri-urban settings in India. The survey found

that women who live in areas with poor lighting, low foot traffic, and abandoned buildings are more likely to feel unsafe. The survey also found that women who have experienced crime are more likely to fear crime. Although these results are too basic, and can be deduced simply without incurring the trouble of searching, it seems vague and not matured results that are classified under specific methods and/or tools. You can just notice two subtitles that appears suddenly and not introduced earlier. They are:

- Spaces where you feel safe.
- Ambience and blind spots

Also, general (common-sense) results that are well known are appeared as genuine results such as:

- Create well-lit and well-maintained public spaces.
- Provide clear sightlines and avoid blind spots.
- Design public spaces that are frequented by people during the day and night.
- Include mixed-use development in urban areas.
- Encourage public transportation use.
- Support community policing programs.

The paper also argues that it is important to consider the social environment of a community when designing for safety. Strong social ties and a sense of community can help to deter crime by making people feel more connected and less vulnerable.

The title "illuminated cities" in Figure 5-1 is repeated.

In general

The paper "Impact of Urban Design in minimizing Women's Fear of Crime" has some limitations that should be considered when interpreting the results.

- The geographical areas in which this research was conducted are very vast and include about seven major cities in India (Mumbai, Bangalore, Chennai, Coimbatore, Kochi, Trichy, and Nagpur). In this case, the impact of spatial, cultural, and social differences on the results cannot be ignored. As such, a sample of 320 participants seems to be too small to be representative of all women in India.
- Following the previous comment, the results of a survey that was conducted in a specific geographic area must not be generalized to other cities or regions.
- The survey seems to ask about all of the factors that contribute to women's fear of crime. The survey only asked about the physical environment, but other factors, such as personal experiences, social norms, and cultural beliefs, can also play a role in women's fear of crime.
- The survey did not measure the effectiveness of the proposed interventions. The paper recommends that urban planners and designers should consider the principles of SCP and CPTED when designing public spaces, but the paper does not provide any evidence to support this claim.

- A deep (inferential) statistical analysis for the findings of the questionnaire is missing.