

Review of: "A Review of Prosody, Punctuation, and Dyslexia: Implications for the Use of Speech Technologies"

Agnieszka Kaldonek-Crnjakovic¹

¹ University of Warsaw

Potential competing interests: The author(s) declared that no potential competing interests exist.

Dear Author,

Thank you for the opportunity of reviewing your work. This is a very interesting topic that has not been researched extensively yet. Here are my suggestions that I hope will help you improve your paper:

- I would use 'learners/individuals/students with dyslexia' instead of 'dyslexic students, etc.' It is a more inclusive term.
- This statement, "Multiple studies and observations have shown that dyslexic students tend to omit punctuation from their writing, but the roots of this difficulty remain largely unexplored." needs further explanation in the text in reference to specific learning difficulties and the role of working memory. Considering the definition of dyslexia, punctuation omission may be a secondary manifestation of the difficulty and may be related to executive functions. In this regard, I would consider the following publications:

- American Psychiatric Association. (2013). Diagnostic and statistical manual of mental disorders (5th ed.). American Psychiatric Association

The section 'Specific Learning Disorder' provides comprehensive information on, among others, diagnostic criteria and procedure followed by an overview of age-related reading and writing difficulties (pages 66-74).

<https://psychiatry.org/psychiatrists/practice/dsm>

- Elliott, J. G. (2020). It's Time to Be Scientific About Dyslexia. *Reading research quarterly* 55(S1), S61–S75.

<https://doi.org/10.1002/rrq.333>

<https://ila.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1002/rrq.333>

- Lyon, G. R., Shaywitz, S. E. & Shaywitz, B. A. (2003). A definition of dyslexia." *Annals of Dyslexia*, 53(1), 1–14.

<https://doi.org/10.1007/s11881-003-0001-9>

<https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s11881-003-0001-9>

- Rose, Jim. (2009). Identifying and teaching children and young people with dyslexia and literacy difficulties. DCSF Publications.

<https://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/ukgwa/20091003161304/http://www.dcsf.gov.uk/jimroseanddyslexia/>

- Snowling, M. J. (2019). *Dyslexia: A very short introduction*. Oxford University Press.

<https://global.oup.com/ukhe/product/dyslexia-a-very-short-introduction-9780198818304?cc=pl&lang=en&>

- Snowling, M., Hulme, C., & Nation, K. (2020). Defining and understanding dyslexia: past, present and future. *Oxford Review of Education*, 46(4), 501–513. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03054985.2020.1765756>

<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/03054985.2020.1765756>

• Adi-Japha, E., Landau, Y. E., Frenkel, L., Teicher, M., Gross-Tsur, V., & Shalev, R. S. (2007). ADHD and dysgraphia: Underlying mechanisms. *Cortex*, 43(6), 700–709. [https://doi.org/10.1016/s0010-9452\(08\)70499-4](https://doi.org/10.1016/s0010-9452(08)70499-4)

- Please consider the above positions for the revision of this statement “Dyslexia is a specific learning disability characterised by reading difficulties, especially in accurate and fluent word recognition, poor decoding and spelling abilities (International Dyslexia Association, 2002).”

- In Prosody, Punctuation, and Dyslexia: The Affordances of Speech Technologies in the Classroom – This part of the paper seems a bit unstructured. I would considering writing a separate part on dyslexia and prosody. Or / And, redrafting this part stressing the importance of the topic and the aim of the paper. The key terms should be clearly and separately discussed.

- In Prosodic Processing in Dyslexia: The below reference is crucial for further studies. The question here is whether lower prosodic awareness features dyslexic difficulties. In this regard, I would consider the latest literature on the topic of dyslexia and the comorbid of dyslexia with other learning difficulties. On the other hand, the cited studies by Goswami et al. earlier in the text provide a reliable reference for further studies. Yet, considering my previous statement, I would consider the individual differences among participants and diagnostic criteria.

“Heggie and Wade-Wolley (2018) present evidence that prosodic awareness is a strong predictor of punctuation ability in adults and that punctuation and prosody facilitate reading comprehension. Specifically, they studied receptive and productive prosodic awareness and productive punctuation ability in literate, educated adults and found statistically significant correlations between prosodic awareness and punctuation skills. However, this relationship has not been explored in dyslexic students or dyslexic learners of English as a foreign language.”

- In Prosodic Processing in Dyslexia: ‘However, this relationship has not been explored in dyslexic students or dyslexic learners of English as a foreign language.’ – I would use terms that would cover different aspects of language acquisition, e.g. in the first and second language. For further discussion, you may consider this publication: Perdomo M, Kaan E. Prosodic cues in second-language speech processing: A visual world eye-tracking study. *Second Language Research*. 2021;37(2):349-375. doi:10.1177/0267658319879196

- The title of the paper announces ‘Implications for the Use of Speech Technologies’; however, little has been discussed in this regard.