

# Review of: "Urban Agroecosystems for Future Food Self-Sufficiency in Cities: Dynamics of Yamuna River Sandbars in Delhi"

Dinesh Chandra Joshi

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

## Second review

Urban Agroecosystems for Future Food Self-Sufficiency in Cities: Dynamics of Yamuna River Sandbars in Delhi

Pulak Das<sup>1</sup>

1. The author has made changes to the title of the paper, which overemphasizes the benefit of cultivation on sandbars.
2. Urban agroecosystems in the Yamuna River sandbars/islands in two locations in Delhi have been studied. These sandbars are used by people for different activities like agriculture, fishing, collection of various types of grasses, and grazing of livestock.
3. Data have been collected by discussion and meetings with people using these sandbars in their own ways. Data from research articles and published reports have been collected to understand the socio-economic activities, agroecosystems, and the dynamicity of the channel deposits.
4. In many parts of the country, cultivation in river beds is a common practice during summer (when the rivers do not have water), particularly growing cucurbits and other vegetables.
5. Authors claim that this will meet future food self-sufficiency, which is overemphasis. Because these sandbars or river beds are available only for 3-4 months. The Yamuna sandbars are also changing in shape and size.
6. Looking at the demand in Delhi, these sandbars produce negligible vegetables. The total population dependent on the sandbar for various activities is over 160. These are from Bihar and go back after the harvest of the crop.
7. As already pointed out, sandbars are available for a few months, changing size in response to river flood and flow, so no permanent assets can be created at the site to enhance production. These are common lands, which may be allotted to any person who comes first; there is no attachment of a worker to the piece of sandbars he is working on presently.
8. I think the author should restrict his approach to the socio-economic use of sandbars, which will vary as per the economic status of the user.

**Conclusion: The study is good, as it brings out the socio-economic benefit of cultivation on sandbars, particularly to poor people. The paper is well-written but overemphasizes the production from sandbars.**

