Review of: "Reducing non-revenue water in Luxor-Egypt using GIS"

Carlos Gaviria[1]

1 Universidad Nacional de Colombia

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

The manuscript presents alternative solutions to a fairly clear problem, which is why it is considered relevant and able to publish. It reflects a strategy to reduce considerable losses in a specific work region. The problem is clear and well defined within the manuscript and well addressed from a global perspective.

In terms of the development of new ideas to resolve the problem, there are no major discoveries; however, the effort to address a rather urgent matter from an investigative point of view is recognized within the work. It is understood that the main proposal for a solution to the issue consists of the installation of measurement and registration systems, the identification of critical points through GIS, the arrangement of the network and the different elements of the system, and the increasing of billing coverage.

It would be good to show different percentages for the 40% total loss detected in the study area. How much is governmental? How much is illegal? Among others. In Figure 1, "Study Area," the image labels are not readable. The geographical context of the study region is not clear; it is suggested that the presentation of graphs and maps be improved. Figure 2, "Satellite Image," is also missing labels, a scale, north indicator, coordinates, and resolution. In general, all map-type figures can be considerably improved.

The sources of information and the data formats used are not clear in the text.

It proposes alternative solutions, although not very novel, that would apparently work and reduce the UFW problem.

The conclusions of the work can be expanded and deepened. It remains to include more citations within the text and provide a brief state of the art.