

Review of: "Alcohol Consumption in Ancient India and the Contemporary Challenges: A Study of Socio-Economic Implications and Anti-Liquor Protests in Tamil Nadu"

Andrés Rodríguez Mera¹

¹ Facultad Latinoamericana de Ciencias Sociales

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

The article minimally relates to the contemporary challenges, socio-economic implications, and anti-liquor protests in Tamil Nadu. However, it describes, significantly, the historical context of alcohol consumption and its profound socio-cultural implications in ancient India. The wording of the text presents time jumps that disorient the reader. For example, All India Anna Dravida Munnetra Kazhagam (AIADMK) partially repealed alcohol prohibition in response to widespread protests. However, this narrative disconnects the influence of the alcohol industry as a strategic vote-catching tool. As a redeemable aspect, one understands how Indian political parties mobilize their stakes in the alcohol business. From the beginning to the end of the text, one doubt remains about the author's position on the total prohibition of alcohol. Are you for or against?

A section that contributes to the state of the art on alcohol regulation is the section dealing with "a sociocultural exploration". At this point in the review, I highlight the existence of a sociological and anthropological literature that analyzes social order and alcohol consumption, literature that could nourish the conclusions of the text. From this perspective, there is a moral order in which alcohol consumption is especially harmful and deplorable. In this line of thought, the wickedness of the consumer who ignores the limits of prudence and with his action kills innocent victims and even himself.

With respect to the objectives of the study, they are, excessively, many. This text is an academic article, not a compilation book. Perhaps the most focused objectives, which compile the author's research pretensions, are to investigate the protests against alcohol in contemporary Tamil Nadu and to understand their motivations and consequences, and to analyze the relationship between prohibition and politics in Tamil Nadu, including the promises made by the political parties in their electoral programs in relation to alcohol prohibition. In this regard, it is worth emphasizing that the methodology of the study is the strongest section of the article. It fulfills the objective of providing a comprehensive understanding of the complex issue of alcohol consumption in Tamil Nadu.

However, in the aspects to be improved, the abysmal jump between the section "Alcohol in ancient Hindu society: a tapestry of perceptions and practices" and the section "Alcohol consumption in India: Trends, consequences and illicit production" stands out. You could insert (write) a middle section (dealing with alcohol issues from the Middle Ages to the early 19th century). In addition, more robust interpretations and analysis are required to present creative and solid results.

For example, the Hindu lawgiver Manu (c. 500 B.C.) condemned alcohol consumption, considering it a vice for society; the reasons that associated such consumption with the lower castes in the shastras are not explained. Although in later paragraphs, the author emphasizes that the kshatriyas, belonging to the warrior and royal class, allowed consuming alcohol as part of their military training and as part of their education, an explanation for these contrasts in alcohol consumption is urgently needed.

At the beginning of this review, I stated that the author's position is ambiguous and frontal. I ratify this by referring to the part where he addresses the findings of the World Health Organization's Global Status Report on Alcohol and Health (2014). Data and percentages (already existing) evidence the significant increase in alcohol consumption between 2008 and 2012. However, and although data on deaths due to adulterated alcohol intake are added, as readers we continue to be unaware of the author's analytical interpretation of the data presented. You could elaborate on alcohol regulation in India and outline a relationship with the other Asian states.

One of the text's attractions lies in the section "Alcohol consumption and its correlation with domestic violence: Global perspectives and local realities". The presentation of life stories adds freshness to the text. Nevertheless, this section seems like an island in a sea of information. The problematic situations described persist in multiple realities (as in Latin America). Nevertheless, what is the relevance of knowing the Tamil Nadu case?

Now, the contribution of the text is located in the section "Political maneuvering and the challenge of prohibition in Tamil Nadu". Perhaps, the focus of discussion lies in the reinstatement of alcohol prohibition (1987) due to a widespread public outcry. This decision came in response to a series of deaths attributed to the consumption of adulterated liquor. A state decision that lasted two years because in 1989 reintroduced the sale of arrack and toddy. The Tamil Nadu State Marketing Corporation (TASMAC) is a tool that preserves a continuous supply of alcohol. However, the other control and regulatory practices and devices that derive from TASMAC's policy exercise remain to be delved into.

Finally, the "Discussion" section should precede the "Conclusion" section. The conclusions are more similar to a summary of the sections presented than to a section detailing the fulfillment of the research objectives, going deeper into the limitations of the text and, above all, reflecting on the results of the problem under study. I insist, it seems that you are in favor of alcohol prohibition, but as a reader, I have never resolved this doubt: Why is the income from the legal sale of alcohol a complicated scenario for those responsible for proposing public policies on alcohol? In addition, should we regulate or deregulate the clandestine production of alcohol? Why?

In addition, I recommend a bibliographic reference to strengthen its socioeconomic analysis from the perspective of public and social problems.