

# Review of: "Environmental Representations in Rocky Records in National Parks in Southeastern Piauí – Brazil"

Renato Kipnis

**Potential competing interests:** No potential competing interests to declare.

The paper needs major editing (*e.g.*, grammar, syntax, incomplete sentences), it is incomprehensible. It is exceedingly difficult to review the paper as it is. It also needs a better focus on the topic being discussed (*i.e.*, environmental concerns by pre-colonial societies in Northeast Brazil). It goes from one topic to another without a logical sequence of ideas, and very brief, very often “truncated” discussion. Topics such as rock art, historical ecology, paleoenvironment, social geography, among others, have a vast literature which is mostly absent in the paper.

The authors mention the important work by Viveiro de Castro on Amerindian perspectivism, but in discussing the zoomorphic figures depicted on the walls of Serra da Capivara and Serra das Confusões they take a simplistic explanation such as being the representation of a white-tailed-deer, and its potential for indicating a different climate in the past. The presence of “men with antlers” depictions in the rock art paintings gives the opportunity to go beyond the ecological explanations.

Another important topic raised in the paper, but very sketchy, is the lack of taphonomical studies in rock art research, but there is no mention of such studies in the two regions. In theory, the rock art differences in the two study areas could be explained by preservation bias and/or survey bias. The paper needs major editing (*e.g.*, grammar, syntax, incomplete sentences), it is incomprehensible. It is exceedingly difficult to review the paper as it is. It also needs a better focus on the topic being discussed (*i.e.*, environmental concerns by pre-colonial societies in Northeast Brazil). It goes from one topic to another without a logical sequence of ideas, and very brief, very often “truncated” discussion. Topics such as rock art, historical ecology, paleoenvironment, social geography, among others, have a vast literature which is mostly absent in the paper.

The authors mention the important work by Viveiro de Castro on Amerindian perspectivism, but in discussing the zoomorphic figures depicted on the walls of Serra da Capivara and Serra das Confusões they take a simplistic explanation such as being the representation of a white-tailed-deer, and its potential for indicating a different climate in the past. The presence of “men with antlers” depictions in the rock art paintings gives the opportunity to go beyond the ecological explanations.

Another important topic raised in the paper, but very sketchy, is the lack of taphonomical studies in rock art research, but there is no mention of such studies in the two regions. In theory, the rock art differences in the two study areas could be explained by preservation bias and/or survey bias.

