

Review of: "Stock Estimation Trial From Spatio-temporal Limited Data of Six Commercial Species in the Middle Madeira River, Southwest Amazon"

Acacio Tomas

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Only the declines in the CPUE x effort ratio make it possible to consider applying surplus catch methods.

Despite the low adjustment of the models (R^2), the regressions' p-values were all significant (Table 1). In addition, by analyzing the total estimated population for each species, we observe that less than 7% is currently being explored, complicating the interpretation of the tendency lines.

Attention should be paid to the "r2," since the reported values should not be evaluated as being driven by a significant biological effect, rather than a statistical one.

Therefore, due to various criticisms of the method chosen, the results should be viewed with caution, particularly with regard to *P. nigriscans* and *P. punctifer*. As the authors point out a few lines later, an "exact analysis" should be done with more data (by expanding the data series).

The questions lamped still need viable answers.

Finally, for all the reasons given in the text, it is clear that Mao's method was not the best choice for discussing the sustainability of fishing in the area.

It shouldn't even be considered an attempt, just an exercise in practice.