Qeios

Peer Review

Review of: "Improved Seed Germination Technique for Prosopis cineraria (L.) Druce: A Rare Sacred Plant of Hindus"

Byron B. Lamont¹

1. Curtin University of Technology, Australia

Introduction

Prosopis is in the family Fabaceae, and you need to note that.

Divide the second paragraph into 3 paragraphs.

Materials and Methods

We need some justification for why so few seeds were used - weren't there other sources of seeds?

The following cannot be correct: 1. A set of five seeds was placed in hot water (100 $^{\circ}$ C) for approximately 3 minutes, followed by immediate washing with tap water to avoid damage to the embryo from the heat. 2. Then, the seeds were nicked with a new razor blade. 3. Some seeds were dipped in lukewarm water for 24 hours.

I have labelled the sentences 1, 2, and 3 – clearly, the order should be 1, 3, then 2.

It is correct science to have lukewarm water and a lukewarm water + nicking treatments so that you can dismiss the positive effect as due to nicking rather than the water, which you cannot do with the current design.

Results

The sample size is completely inadequate to show any treatment effect, although the nicking treatment was the only one to give 100% germination.

Discussion

The diversion into discussing other aspects of the species' biology does not fit in with the title of the manuscript. If you really think these rather anecdotal observations are of great interest to readers,

then you need to change the title.

Declarations

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.