

# Review of: "Thought Experiment: from Phenomenology to Transcendental Meditation and Dream about the Meaning of Time"

Oleksandr Kholod<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Vasyl Stefanyk Precarpathian National University

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Dear Mr. José Luis García Vigilia, thank you, colleague,

thank you, colleague, for the opportunity to read your work "The Artistic Experiment: From Phenomenology to Transcendental Meditation and Dreaming of the Meaning of Time".

I read it with delight and surprise since I myself have been participating in an experiment using my wife's method for the second month. The experiment is designed for 6 months (from July 17, 2023 to January 17, 2024).

I also use the method of self-observation and reflection. I am also the only participant in the experiment. But I will talk about this in my article - a report on the experiment. Now I will say two words about the impression I have from your article.

1. In the heading "Theoretical and conceptual basis" you list the methods of "Husserl's phenomenology of perception", "the psychology of Alfred Binet and Pierre Jeanet", the methods of "Merleau Ponty", "analogical, transcendental psychology", "classic psychoanalysis of Freud in the analysis of dreams", "Bachelard's dream theory", "dream about words", then go to the list of fields of knowledge: "evidence-based psychotherapy", "some others coming from information sciences and neurosciences". Dear colleague, I think it would not be worthwhile to generalize the list of methods in this way (although you do not actually name the methods).
2. The definition of sleep as "being in a state of rest, which consists of inactivity or suspension of the senses and all voluntary movements" (Dictionary of the Spanish Language 2019), in my opinion, is not correct, because during sleep the senses are not suspended, but rather, can be in different stages of sleep, either in a state of activity or in a state of passivity. Feelings cannot be stopped at all, because the functions of the nervous system (respectively, the brain) cannot be completely stopped.
3. Unfortunately, I am not familiar with Mr. Bachelard's work (Gaston Bachelard. Dreams about dreams. The word dreamer. The poetry of dreams. Ed. Fondo de Cultura Económica, third edition; pp. 49-87. Mexico 2000). At the same time, it is difficult not to consider the stages of sleep, which you, dear Mr. José Luis García Vigilia, for some reason do not mention.
4. You report on "a thought experiment with theoretical and conceptual arguments, where the method and main tool is an introspective excursion into my mind, my feelings and my consciousness" (quoting from the manuscript of your article -

<https://www.qeios.com/read/3B7R32#HQCfX9mtuL5n>). A question arises for you, colleague: Is it sufficient to use only the method of introspection for the conclusions you propose at the end of the article? You mention James Joyce, "Ulysses" (for example, the inner monologue that passes through my mind; or how Marcel Proust travels in his thoughts to definite or timeless times in his work "In Search of Lost Time" (see manuscript - <https://www.qeios.com/read/3B7R32#HQCfX9mtuL5n>). There is a question for you again, dear Mr. José Luis García Vigilia: 1. "You rely on non-scientific texts of Joyce and Proust in a scientific article because you rely on phenomenology?". 2. "Is there a phenomenological methodology in scientific circulation, based not on creative texts, but on scientific concepts?".

5. Your goals, colleague, surprised me. For example, the goal formulated in paragraph 1: "Conduct an imaginary experiment with the help of an internal monologue, exploring the meaning of time through introspection" (see the text - <https://www.qeios.com/read/3B7R32#HQCfX9mtuL5n>). Please explain what you mean by "internal monologue": Is it the monologue of the researcher himself? And what about introspection? Did you mean internal monologue using introspection?
6. Goal 2 (see point 2) states: "Using a model of two-way and horizontal dialogic communication, determine the conscious perception of terms and concepts related to time" (see - <https://www.qeios.com/read/3B7R32#HQCfX9mtuL5n>). Please explain the meaning of the terms "bilateral dialogue" and "horizontal dialogue". Thank you. And how to understand "conscious perception of terms"? So there is an "unconscious perception of terms"? If the latter meaning exists, is there any reason to do introspection? And to what extent will such introspection be conscious? IF, will the unconscious perception of terms affect introspection? I will be grateful for the answers.
7. In paragraph 3 of the stated research objectives, you report: "Compare the evidence obtained during the conscious investigation of the passage of time, in the immediate context of the bedroom and my bed(s) at night before sleep and after meditating in an introspective manner with a focus on the rhythm of my breathing ( inhale-exhale)" (see - <https://www.qeios.com/read/3B7R32#HQCfX9mtuL5n>). The quoted wording allows us to predict that the perception of the passage of time (and the understanding of time) is influenced not only by meditation but also by the rhythm of your breathing. It is so? In that case, why don't you, colleague, take into account other important influencing factors, such as the duration of sleep, the quality of nutrition, the rhythm of the pulse before and after meditation, the quality of the stimuli that you apply during meditation, the general state of well-being, the state of the weather, the time of day, your life experience, the influence of information flows that accompanied you during the previous time before meditation? I will be glad to hear from you. Since I myself am currently conducting a similar experiment, the purpose of which is to introspectively measure the effect on the state of the symptoms of the disease, which is popularly called the "restless legs effect", thanks to meditation (to music), chrysotherapy (therapy thanks to stones), prayers (invocation of the genus), quality of nutrition etc. I also record the sleep factor as a factor that reflects the state of my health and the improvement/deterioration of the intensity of "restless legs" movements.
8. Dear Mr. José Luis García Vigilia, I will be grateful if you explain the details of the "analysis of dream content (self-analysis) according to the method and technique of Sigmund Freud", which you report in the text of the article (see - <https://www.qeios.com/read/3B7R32#HQCfX9mtuL5n>). You mean that "the analyst can distinguish between the manifest content and the latent content of the dream. The hidden content refers to the main meaning of sleep. During

sleep, the unconscious condenses, shifts and forms an idea about the meaning of the dream, the hidden meaning of which often cannot be recognized by the individual after waking up" (Sigmund Freud. Interpretation of dreams; translated by Volodymyr Tchaikovsky. Kharkiv: Folio, 2019, 603)?

9. How did you use the Kappa concordance test? Please elaborate. Thank you.
10. In the formulation of the hypothesis, you report: "The perception of time during the act of sleep and dreaming, in comparison with introspective meditation, gives rise to the concept of subjective or relative duration" (see the text of the article - <https://www.qeios.com/read/3B7R32#HQCfx9mtuL5n>). Please explain what the "concept of subjective or relative duration" is. You mean the works of B. Brandshaft and J. Atwood, who suggested "implementing an intersubjective approach in the psychoanalytic process, interpreting it as an interaction of the subjective realities of the patient, the analyst, and the intersubjective field" (see - Stolorow R. , Brandshaft B., Atwood J. Clinical psychoanalysis. Intersubjective approach. Cogito-Center, 1999, 252). Thank you.
11. It is NOT clear how you measured the time (4 hours) during the vision of the dream that you described in the "Content of the dream" section. I understand that you could measure the physical time (2 hours of sleep) thanks to the clock. But how did you define 4 hours of subjective time? Please disclose the details of such measurement. Thank you.
12. Regardless of your attitude to my questions, I am grateful to you, dear colleague, for the first results in my life of a thought experiment that bears similarities to my previously mentioned experiment. I am currently completing only the 2nd month (of the intended six months) of the experiment. Your article and perhaps your interpretations in the answers to my questions will help me in the interpretation of the data I expect (after January 17, 2024).

Thank you.

Health to you and creative scientific inspiration!!!

Sincerely, Doctor of Sciences in Philology and Social Communications, Professor Oleksandr Kholod (Kyiv, Ukraine).