

Review of: "Why is vertebral pneumaticity in sauropod dinosaurs so variable?"

Michela Johnson¹

¹ University of Edinburgh

Potential competing interests: The author(s) declared that no potential competing interests exist.

This is a well written, concise paper on gives an overview of vertebral pneumaticity in sauropods.

One thing I was hoping to read was something on the comparison of vertebrae and their pneumaticity (both in text and figure form) between (1) sauropod species, (2) sauropods and other dinosaurs, and potentially (3) sauropods and other non-dinosaurian archosaurs. The abstract gave me the impression that this would be discussed later in the paper but it was rarely touched on. Including this would have made for a more "complete" paper and would provide some interesting biological and phylogenetic questions about trends in vertebral pneumaticity; it also would have provided some sort of new information. Is there a phylogenetic signal, and why or why not? Are there specific trends in sauropods; are they the only dinosaurs that display this variability or do we see this in other dinosaur groups? Having composite figures as well (with 2+ taxa) would also be something to think about, so the reader can actively compare e.g. the vascular foramen in both an ontogenetic and species context.