

# Review of: "Picture collage: A pedagogical reflective practice tool for nursing students in mental health practice"

Amanda Edmondson<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Nottingham Trent University

**Potential competing interests:** No potential competing interests to declare.

This is a very interesting article, thank you for inviting me to review it. It has been a pleasure to read about an interesting and innovative approach to student learning, using visual materials. This is something that I will definitely consider in my own work - thank you for the guidance.

Some minor points to consider:

P2: You may wish to consider using a more up to date definition of mental health - WHO 2022 have more recently defined mental health as “Mental health is a state of mental well-being that enables people to cope with the stresses of life, realize their abilities, learn well and work well, and contribute to their community”.

P3: Minor grammatical issues with this sentence, may consider re-writing to help understanding. “Since its foundation in 1971; the UAE has made progress in developing mental health care service provision; with an increasing number of mental health professionals but traditional understanding and methods of treating mental illness still prevail (Thomas et al 2015, Haque and Al Kindi 2015)”. Might read more clearly if written as: *Since its foundation in 1971; the UAE has made progress in developing mental health care service provision; despite an increasing number of mental health professionals, traditional understanding and methods of treating mental illness still prevail*

P4 - where the article refers to the experiences of the current cohort of students, it refers to the students experiencing anxiety perpetuated by the skewed perception of danger (These feelings of anxiety were perpetuated by the skewed perception of mental health and common stereotypes and fear that all patients with mental illness are dangerous (Hunter et al 2015).” It's not clear how this is known about the cohort. Is the article stating that these students may have experienced heightened anxiety due to fear etc, or was this known prior to their placement?

P4 - minor grammatical issues with this sentence: “The UK is among the very few countries where the nursing workforce is formalised in different specialities and educated nurses in stand-alone preregistration nursing specialities for Mental Health, Adult, Children and Learning Disabilities” - may read more clearly written as *“The UK is among the very few countries where the nursing workforce is formalised in different specialities and students are educated in stand-alone preregistration nursing specialities for Mental Health, Adult, Children and Learning Disabilities”*

P6 - an interesting comment here which starts to bring about the rationale for the picture collage “Being aware of the

*students' highly contextual culture **where communication often occurs without the need for verbalisation**(Samovar 2012) was an enabling factor to find a medium that would allow them to fully examine their inner thoughts and feelings about mental health practice."* - as a reader I wanted to know more about this. Could the authors perhaps expand a little here?

P6 - another interesting comment "use of art-based pedagogy has been systematically examined and its effectiveness in facilitating reflection in engaging nursing students to create meaning to their practice experiences and developing their proficiencies has been demonstrated (Rieger et al 2016)."How? as a reader I wanted to know more about this. Could the authors perhaps expand a little here?

P7 - the note about debriefing in the post picture collage discussion. We haven't yet heard about the process so perhaps consider if this might come later in the article?

P7 - minor grammatical issues with this sentence: "During their penultimate reflective practice group meeting, the students were informed about ~~what~~ the undertakings of the picture collage in their final reflective practice meeting."

P6/7 - suggestion to edit the order of information regarding the section which describes the process of undertaking the reflective activity using picture collage. It might be useful to report how the students were prepared for the task, introduce the task, followed by their experience of it, and the debrief, At the moment it starts with mention of the debrief, followed by their experience, followed by preparation for the task - this can be a little difficult to follow.

Final point - as a facilitator(s), did you feel that any of the students expressed difficulty with the task ( I can see some found the collective experience easier and perhaps this is due to more common issues relating to verbally presenting, rather than the task itself) - it would be really interesting to hear the authors views on this. Also, do you think there were issues specific to the **visual element** of this reflective task that were uniquely helpful? - if so, please expand. I am particularly interested to hear if you found it to be the visual element here that helped the students, or was it perhaps more to do with the safety and fun that they experienced (which clearly aids learning).