

Review of: "Historical evolution of culture, mind, and language. Considerations basing on Everett's study upon the Pirahã"

Anna Aragno

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

I have only a few comments regarding this paper, 'Historical Evolution of Culture, Mind, and Language,' which I found to be a very interesting read. Dr. Oesterdiekhoff presents a strong critique that although he states is based on 'considerations' of Everett's Study of the Pirahã, is designed I believe to go beyond. In fact, the paper is important less for its specific current subject matter than for the implications of this critique, namely the problem with specialization in academic fields and the narrow interpretive window this provides, especially in this case. Or, viewed from the opposite direction, the need for multidisciplinary scholarship in the study of history, culture, mind, and language.

Dr. Oesterdiekhoff throughout proposes alternative *developmental* explanations for many of the interpretations made from a traditional anthropological perspective by Everett, which, from the viewpoint of those who are familiar with cognitive development make a lot of sense. The practical problem with this broader implication underlying the paper is that it is hard enough to master one field in academia let alone master several and even rarer to be able to integrate salient aspects of each pertaining to a specific topic. In fact, the author's critique is valid for any evolutionary, historical, and/or cultural subject, because these inevitably involve the feedback loops that promoted the cognitive development of mind and language through cultural change.

The paper's one drawback is that the English leaves a lot to be desired. It is often not written in good English grammar and the turns of phrase are also not really English. The paper would benefit greatly from a rewrite with an eye to perfecting its English something I hope will be done so that its important content may be read in print by many.