

# Review of: "Evaluating Hydrologic, Geomorphic, and Vegetation Parameters to Assess Natural, Living, and Hardened Shorelines along the Northern Gulf of Mexico"

Necla Koralay<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Karadeniz Technical University

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Dear Author,

The following section contains the evaluations I have made about your article.

Reviewer Comments to the Author:

**1-** In the introduction section: Presenting natural shorelines, hardened shorelines, and living shorelines under a single heading like "Introduction" in the article's introduction section may be more engaging for the reader.

**2-** The study is good in terms of method and content, but the form and content of "Studys Sites" sections should be evaluated. You can rewrite the section as follows:

"Studys Sites" Section:

The general description, size, and boundaries of the study area can be included here. Climatic data such as the region's climate type, average temperature, and annual precipitation can be specified. These pieces of information have significant impacts on the area's ecological structure and available resources. Topographic data such as elevation, slope, hills, valleys, and other geographical features mentioned here provide essential insights into water drainage, erosion potential, distribution of vegetation, and other ecological processes. Including information about the coordinate data provides the reader with an idea of the study area's location in the world. These data are crucial for understanding the current state of the area and for planning purposes. Mapping, monitoring, and determining the location based on coordinate systems are of critical importance. By including these details under the study area section, readers can gain a better understanding of the area. This information serves as a foundation for future research and is essential for effective planning. Therefore, providing such information under the study area section is crucial for getting acquainted with the area.

After introducing the study area as described above, the methods used within the study can be explained under separate headings, sequentially. However, it is essential to first introduce the study area as mentioned above.

**3.** The Result section:

In general, articles include the main data, such as numerical values, tables, figures, and statistical analyses obtained from the conducted research, in the Results section. The provided results should be accompanied by references and discussed in the Discussion section, where they are evaluated. In your article, you have often presented the data you found in the Results section and discussed the reasons behind them. You can remove this information and add it to the Discussion section.

**4-** There is no citation in the article for Sicangco et al. (2021) in the reference section. You can add it as a citation or remove it from the reference section.

Sicangco, C., Collini, R., Martin, S., Monti, A., Sparks, E. (2021). Cost-benefit analysis of a small-scale living shorelineproject <https://repository.library.noaa.gov/view/noaa/48521>

**5-** I uploaded my criticism and comment by making some markings and comments on the pdf file.