

# Review of: "Assessment of soil erosion in the Cesar watershed, an initial step toward the restoration of the Cesar River"

Liliana Betancurth<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Universidad de Antioquia

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

The manuscript title is very consistent, but I got lost it during the reading of the text. Topic is nowadays very important in many Colombian rivers, however the findings is the Cesar Watershed seems not be a significant influence for the huge Magdalena River. The software tools and methodology with formulas is very good, but need more emphasis along the manuscript to justify their use. You can extend some items along the document.

- There is a lack of clarity in the sampling: *"144 samples of erosion rates in the watershed were calculated by combining the basic variables of the RUSLE-GGS model. In addition, 720 sediment yield samples (SSY) were generated by applying the five transfer functions (SDR)"*. This amount is samples sound very robuts, but it is not enough clear how those were analyzed.
- There is a lack of comparison with other watersheds wordwide with similar climatic or geomorfological framework.
- Figures are very pixelated, and colors in figure 4 do not help to diferenciarte the clasiffication.
- Results and discussion are mixed, I suggest to separate those.
- Item III / B of the results and discussion seems to be already the conclusions.
- Item III/ C talks about *"alarming levels of soil degradation due to erosion"*,but the results of this research are not in agreement, I suggest a deeper discussion about it, that could help to choice the real areas in the Department of Cesar to invest national resources in restauration.

Manuscript has a very good potential, it could be really adjust to gain cientific interest.