Review of: "Evaluating Hydrologic, Geomorphic, and Vegetation Parameters to Assess Natural, Living, and Hardened Shorelines along the Northern Gulf of Mexico"

Helena Granja

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Dear authors, here are some questions and suggestions:

- Are the 6 case studies all within a barrier island system (Gulf Islands)?

- To facilitate the reading of those who do not know the region, it would be preferable to also insert the abbreviations of the study sites in Fig. 1.

- In fig. 2 a reader unfamiliar with the region faces the same difficulty locating.

- Table 1. What do you mean by significant differences in mean concerning average wave power?Why is the salinity on the low-energy coast much higher in winter than in summer?

- Page 10. The first reference to the role of winds appears in Results.Why isn't there a compass rose? Would help.

- Table 2. What are the relative exposure units?

- Table 3. Why is there such a big difference in OM between low (lower) and high energy (higher) LS?

- Page 12. Why does high energy LS have 18% more OM?

- On page 13 there is an overly obvious sentence concerning the sand and silt/clay relationship. Please read carefully the text on page 13 and compare with table 4.How do you explain such a large % of coarse sand in low-energy NS?

- Attention to the numbering of figs. On pages 14 and 17 there are figures with the same number - Fig. 5.Please correct the numbers in the following figs.

- Fig. 5, page 17. The meaning of the symbols - circle, square and triangle - should be mentioned in the caption.

- Only on page 19 (in the Discussion) is the relative exposure calculation method mentioned.

- On page 19, erosion rates values are mentioned for the three types of coast. Where do these values come from?Where are the values (2011-2019) for erosion rates? And for slopes?

- Fig. 7. Why is the slope in C (low energy) so high? Further down 3-4 lines,you write the opposite.

- On page 23, in the Conclusions, you refer to the slope angle, sediment supply and space for vegetation to retreat upslope. However, throughout the article these important aspects were not mentioned.

- No references are cited in the text to: Gittman, R.K., Fodrie, F.J., Popowich, A.M., Keller, D.A., Bruno, J.F., Currin, C.A., Peterson, C.H., & Piehler, M.F. (2015).

O'Donnell, J. E. D. (2017)..

Sicangco, C., Collini, R., Martin, S., Monti, A., Sparks, E. (2021).