Review of: "Crossing between Conceptual Metaphor Theory and Text World Theory"

Nathalie Gontier¹

1 Universidade de Lisboa

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Many thanks to the editors, I was quite happy to receive this review request on such an important topic. Metaphor theory as introduced by Lakoff & Johnson (1980) and expanded by conceptual blending theory as introduced by Fauconnier and Turner (2002) and Coulson (2001) was a way whereby the field of linguistics was able to connect with the fields of cognitive psychology and sociocultural anthropology. Today, as metaphor theory is about to celebrate its semicentennial birthday, it has evolved into a well-established research area ready to take on new challenges. One of those involves an investigation into how metaphors are not only functional in discourse or text, but how they underlie actual worldview formation. To find answers, the author of this paper turns to text world theory and distinguishes between various world concepts, including "mental worlds", Kripke (1972) & Lewis' (1973) "possible worlds", and Beaugrande and Dressler's (1981) "text-relevant world," before settling on Werth's (1999) concept of a world understood as a cognitive structure emerging from bodily interactions with an outer environment. The author then combines insights from conceptual metaphor theory with text world theory to analyze aspects of political speeches. While the analysis is interesting, the theoretical part on world concepts and human-environment interactions remains underdeveloped. Future research could benefit from linking to philosophical research on worldview formation (Gontier et al 2022a, 2022b), cognitive, sociocultural, and ecological research on niche construction (Bertolotti & Magnani 2017; Sinha 2015; Odling-Smee, Lala (fka Laland) & Feldman 2003); enactivism (Di Paolo, Cuffari & De Jaegher 2018), and general 4-E cognitive theories (Newen, Gallagher, De Bruin 2018). I personally would furthermore be interested in seeing more research on how metaphor theory relates to protolanguage research and its various implementations of 4-E cognitive theory (Ferretti 2022; Zlatev, Żywiczyński & Wacewicz 2020; Adoretti et al 2022).

References

Adornetti I, Chiera A, Altavilla D, Deriu V, Lecci CM, Marini A, Valeri G, Magni R, Ferretti F (2022). How do we comprehend linguistic and visual narratives? A study in children with typical development. Language Sciences, 93, 101500.

Bertolotti T, Magnani L (2017). Theoretical considerations on cognitive niche construction. Synthese 194, 4757–4779.

Coulson S (2001). Semantic leaps. Cambridge University Press.

de Beaugrande R & Dressler W (1981). Introduction to text linguistics. Longman.

Di Paolo EA, Cuffari EC & De Jaegher H (2018). Linguistic bodies. MIT Press.

Fauconnier G & Turner M (2002). The way we think. Basic Books.

Ferretti F (2022). Narrative persuasion. Springer.

Gontier N, Couto D, Fontaine M, Magnani L, Arfini S (2022). Correction: Introduction: language and worldviews. Topoi 41, 447–448.

Gontier N, Couto D, Fontaine M, Magnani L, Arfini S et al. (2022). Introduction: Language and worldviews. Topoi 41, 439–445.

Kripke S (1972). Naming and necessity. Blackwell.

Lakoff G & Johnson M (1980). Metaphors we live by. University of Chicago Press.

Lewis D (1973). Counterfactuals. Blackwell.

Newen A, Gallagher S, De Bruin L (2018). 4E cognition: Historical roots, key concepts, and central issues. In Newen A, De Bruin L, Gallagher S (eds), The Oxford handbook of 4E cognition, https://doi.org/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780198735410.013.1

Odling-Smee J, Lala (fka Laland), Feldman M (2003). Niche construction. Princeton University Press.

Sinha C (2015). Language and other artifacts: socio-cultural dynamics of niche construction. Frontiers in Psychology 6, 1601.

Werth P (1999). Text worlds. Longman.

Zlatev J, Żywiczyński P, Wacewicz S (2020). Pantomime as the original human-specific communicative system. Journal of Language Evolution 5, 2, 156–174.