

Review of: "FDA Decision to Authorize NJOY ACE Menthol Was Based on a Rigorous Review of the Science to Determine That the Benefits Outweigh the Risk"

Gustavo R. Mota¹

¹ Institute of Health Sciences - Department of Sport Sciences, Federal University of Triângulo Mineiro, Uberaba, Brazil

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

This commentary provides a thorough defense of the FDA's decision to authorize NJOY ACE menthol-flavored e-cigarettes, supported by substantial scientific evidence. The author effectively highlights the reduced harmful constituent levels and biomarkers of exposure for adult smokers who switch from traditional cigarettes to NJOY ACE products, presenting a compelling case for potential harm reduction benefits. Furthermore, the commentary addresses the ongoing risk of youth initiation and the role of unregulated disposable e-cigarettes, which supports the argument for the FDA's regulated approach.

While the scientific rigor of the commentary is commendable, I recommend a more explicit public health message in the conclusion. Given that e-cigarettes are not without risk, a concluding statement could clarify that, although NJOY ACE may reduce harm compared to traditional cigarettes, it still poses health risks. This added balance would underscore the importance of responsible harm reduction messaging and ensure clarity around the residual health risks associated with e-cigarette use, particularly for new users.

Although I am not a specialist in tobacco products, I find the arguments and evidence presented here scientifically sound and constructive. A balanced concluding message, as recommended, could strengthen the commentary's public health perspective for readers. **Unfortunately, I do not have access to the original *JAMA* article, which would help in addressing this comment with more context.**