Review of: "Analysing the conglomeration of various urban pockets through the lens of environmental design for crime prevention: A case of Kolkata"

Jun Won Seo[1]

1 University of Seoul

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

This research is highly significant in that it has revealed the features of CPTED elements in three areas of Kolkata, India. However, there are aspects that need to be further refined and addressed in the future.

1. Abstract

- Researchers wrote a lot about the background. It would be better if researcher will make up the method, results, and implications.

2. Introduction

- The research objective seems somewhat superficial. You claim to analyze CPTED components in architecture and urban design. But it's unclear how this distinguishes from existing research in the introduction. It would be beneficial to more clearly illustrate what different perspective you're bringing in the context of Kolkata's landscape.
- Also, researchers should explain about 'Dalan'. (why it is important.)

3. Literature Review (hereafter LR)

- Move the contents about crime rate in India and Kolkata into the Introduction.
- Researchers shouls write the discussion around studies related to CPTED in LR.

4. Methods

- While the selection of the target area was refered from a report, it would be good that the selection standard will be refered from existing relative research.
- It would be beneficial to present charateristics of the mentioned six criteria for the each target areas into a new table.
- Specify the rationale for the selection of variables. Please indicate from which study these variables in Table 1 were derived.
- Is the survey based on a 5-point Likert scale or a 7-point Likert scale?

5. Results

- The first paragraph in Result chapter should be in Method chapter.

- Researchers highlighted the common elements despite survey on various charactered sites. Are there any significant differences in the Primary Dimension across these three sites?
- Please add interpretations of statistical results of conducting SEM. Also, clarify the significances (p-values) of the variables.
- Explain the meaning of each value in the view of preventing crime.
- Interpret the meaning of elements showing positive values and those with negative values.
- The radar charts, in essence, should be written in Chapter 4. And those radar charts present the value difference among dimension items. Please interpret the result of analyzing these value difference.

6. Conclusion

- Please describe details and meaning about 'Dalan' in the introduction chapter and result chapter. Especially, explain the relationship between those items and the environment of Dalan.
- Finally, what does the result of this study signify?
- Add the similarities and differences this study has with existing research.