Review of: "The Traumas of Displacement and Not Belonging"

Andreas Maercker[1]

1 University of Zurich

The article is a good overview of a viable Jungian analytical position on psychotraumatology. It also brings in Kristeva's interesting version of the abyss. I find it very nice to see the co-construction of symbolic space, which continues to be an important Jungian idea, being addressed.

As someone who has been working in psychotraumatology for decades, I have two fundamental problems with the paper, which can perhaps be addressed in a self-reflexive concluding paragraph entitled "Discussion of the own approach".

1. I do not see the novelty of the approach. Other authors have also described experiences of racism and migration as ongoing (micro-)traumas and related them to Carl Gustav Jung's literature on trauma *avant la lettre*. Moreover, I am missing from the relevant literature of the Jungian tradition a very significant author, John P. Wilson, and his elaborate remarks (2004) on traumatic experiences as abyss experiences, which go far beyond Kristeva.

2. In general, in the context of mental health and its international terminology, I have problems extending the meaning of traumatic experiences to phenomena beyond the WHO (or American DSM) definition. According to these definitions, traumas are " exceptional, catastrophic threats", i.e. threats of death or to bodily integrity. Various authors have pointed out the meaning creep of an extension and its negative consequences. This danger was once made clear to me by the WHO Director for Mental Health Dr. Shekhar Saxena as follows: *Unfortunately, in resource-poor countries, psychopathological knowledge among health professionals is increasingly be reduced to: All mental problems are either trauma or psychosis*. (My comment: This cannot be in line with Jungian psychology).

One minor point: the reference Solomon (2004)(?) is not listed in the references.