Review of: "The Catholic School: Holistic?"

Graham Rossiter

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Review of the article by Brendan Carmody.

The core of this article is its attempt to show how the theology of Bernard Lonergan can be used to address the potential problem of conflict between scientific knowledge and knowledge of a more personal kind – psychological and sociological as well as individuals' own personal understandings. The article is detailed and clearly argued. It provides a systematic and useful account of this issue.

The problem of knowledge that the article addresses is certainly important for the idea of a holistic education – the sort of education one would expect should cover the different forms of knowledge.

A problem that I have with the article lies in the title. It asked the question how holistic is education in Catholic schools. This is a title that has an immense scope. It might make a reader wonder what is a useful definition of holistic education. And what aspects of Catholic education might be concerned in particular. This can cause some ambiguity and confusion in terms of the expectations of readers. Readers' understandings of the broad term holistic education would influence their expectations of what the article might be about and of the literature on holistic education that might be referenced. A change in article title to be more specific about its contents would help avoid such ambiguity and show how the issue in knowledge is one aspect of what a holistic education entails.

Therefore, it would seem to me more appropriate to rename the article in a succinct way that highlights its central focus on the theological approach of Bernard Lonergan. For example a title something like: "How the theological approach of Bernard Lonergan can address potential conflicts between scientific and personal knowledge in education: implications for Catholic education."