

# Review of: "Encounters with Others: Student Growth through Fieldwork Studies in Rural Areas"

Alejandro Peña-Ayala<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Instituto Politécnico Nacional

**Potential competing interests:** No potential competing interests to declare.

## Evaluation of the paper

### Title

Encounters with Others: Student Growth through Fieldwork Studies in Rural Areas

### Abstract

It is clear that the topic, purpose, and results of the study, in addition to being related to a relevant problem in rural communities, need the support of High Education students to highlight main issues and look for ways to cope with them. Only, it is missing a descriptive statistic in order to know "Some migrated or planned to migrate to rural areas and start their entrepreneurial businesses...", "Student Growth through Fieldwork Studies in Rural Areas"...

### Introduction

Avoid pleonasm with "various."

Clarify "the rural areas of many developed countries are in decline." Which kind of "decline"?

From the last paragraph, it is necessary to precise the purpose of the research, the problem to be solved, and the proposed solution.

More citations of related works, as well as the academic, social, and economical issues, are necessary to enhance the Introduction.

The presentation and light description of the remaining sections should be outlined in this section.

### Theoretical Background

Diverse clauses of the 1st paragraph lack citations to sound the statements, e.g., "Depending... learning.", "However... future.", "Rural areas..."

A definition with its respective citation is needed for: "community-based/engaged learning, project/problem-based learning, and service learning."

The complete paragraphs “However... of areas”, “Few studies...” define diverse interesting assertions without their respective citation to back such affirmations.

Rural Development and the University in Japan

Similar observations about suitable citations to support valuable statements are made for this section as, for instance, “However, when...”, “Young people...”

This sentence “Thus, migration to and visits to rural areas have spread among some people” looks contradictory to the prior statements...

Similar note for “Students gain knowledge and understanding of the region they studied but are not likely to work or live in that region”; what level of academic studies?

Reviewers’ confession: “I used to live in Osaka for a couple of years!”

Provide a statistic for “The number of international tourists...”

Add the name of key cities and municipalities and the perimeter of Osaka and the Kansai region in Fig. 1.a & 1.b to facilitate their interpretation.

Counterpart Communities

Identify some “municipalities in the Kansai region.”

Reveal the quantity of interviews, the name of the municipality, and the university involved in the illustrated cases

Edit as a relation the expectations taken into account: 1) If a university is in the region, it is easy for local municipalities to collaborate...; 2) including local companies ...;

Provide the complete list of topics: renewable energy,...

Concerning the residents, quantify the amount of samples, the average size of the sample...

Trace a process and timeline of the cooperation between scholars and residents, as well as the participation of the officials

Separate the briefing and statistics for both regions where there are / are not universities located, as well as regions that face a declining population...

State a list of benefits for the residents: purchase of local products, entrepreneurship,...

Statistical measures are needed to identify the impact, interests, and preferences of residents, students, professors, and officials

Graduates

“...40 people”, which (e.g., residents, students, professors, and officials)?

Reveal the guide and script of each type of interview

Similar editing and statistics demand for the diversity of interests revealed for residents, students, professors, and officials

An appendix with a sample of the experience shared by students / graduates is necessary to highlight the contributions, gains, and shortcomings during the FWS of the participants in their own words, in addition to the change of mind (e.g., “there were no attractive people that I could aspire to be like. But at FWS, I saw many cool adults...”), including the testimony of residents who support and adopted scholars’ proposals

Particularly, entrepreneurial aims and projects are desirable to quantify as part of the briefing

Provide as findings some reflections such as: “He realized that working hard to earn money is not the only way to live and that there are other options. He now works for a nonprofit business in another rural area of Japan.”; “I realized that the pesticide-free vegetables I had learned about locally were very difficult to grow and very important for one’s health”

Discussion

The style of the text edited in this section is similar to the one of previous ones, where a chronicle and briefing are given instead of providing classic items of the research, such as: main outcomes, key findings, usefulness of the proposed approach to solve the research problem, responses to the research questions, constraints and achievements, a comparison of this work against a sample of related ones...

Conclusions

It is missing the Conclusion section, with traditional items, as for instance: future research...

References

Include fresh references and valuable demography and social statistics of the involved regions

Comments for author

It is a valuable work, the FWS of which was applied for the Osaka, Japan region and is also useful to be adopted for any other regions worldwide

The aim of how higher education students and graduates can be engaged with the economic and social development of rural regions, with and without universities, and those that face the emigration of young people, as well as their decrease rate, represents a relevant issue for developed and undeveloped countries

Also, the diversity of expectations for residents, scholars, and officials are valuable findings, as well as the reported experiences

However, the style of editing and writing, including the content, requires diverse amendments to improve the quality of the

paper, such as: structuring in diverse subtopics, structuring the diverse sections to facilitate the explanation of the work, instead of editing a briefing, systematically structuring the text according to the main factors that are exposed (e.g., actor, type of region, sort of expectation, kind of findings), sharing quantitative and statistical information to highlight the sample's features, expectations, ways of cooperation..., outlining the questionnaires, and organizing the reports of experiences given by scholars and residents

#### Comments for editor

This valuable work can be accepted for publication once the author applies the suggested amendments to improve the article