

Review of: "The Impact of Urban Design in minimizing Women's Fear of Crime"

Margot Rubin¹

¹ Cardiff University

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

General Comments:

The paper raises important and interesting questions about women's perception of crime and safety in major cities in India and uses a quantitatively designed study to access these perceptions. Although there is much to recommend this paper it is not yet ready for publication primarily for the following reasons:

- It is not clear what the main argument and unique contribution of the paper is - it seems to be going over some very well-established ground and the novelty of the contribution is a bit opaque.
- The study is not well-situated in the current debates and literature on crime against women or the latest ideas in the relationship between design, patriarchy and crime - this needs significant deepening.
- The methodology does not appear very rigorous and makes one question the voracity of the findings - this may be due to omissions of details rather than an actual problem with the methods and approach that were used but it is hard to tell with so few details offered. I would also be cautious about mixing online and offline survey data.
- The paper is not logically structured in its current form and is hard to follow - why are the images right at the end of the paper etc

Overall there is some interesting data but it does require substantial re-writing and restructuring before this would be publishable. I have made some specific points below:

- Language and Grammar need to be tidied up- Theft and Robbery, Kidnapping & Abduction, Rape, Assault on women
- Need definitions for an international audience as to: what constitutes crime against women? What is the NCRB report? What are the crime stats in the cities that were prioritised? What is chain snatching?
- A very stark transition between discussion of crime stats and definition of crime prevention
- Numerous elements, such as socio-economic considerations, cultural backgrounds, environmental influences, poverty, etc., affect the offender's motivation to commit the crime. - this statement needs to be unpacked and referenced
- where the majority of crimes occur, - claim needs to be evidenced
- Two main strategies for prevention of crimes in urban setting include Situational Crime Prevention (SCP) and Crime Prevention through Environmental Design (CPTED). - need to be referenced and discussed -
- Crime triangle needs to be referenced
- The article is rather oddly structured and does not follow a logical format - the discussion of CPTED precedes the

literature review.

- The literature review is just a table of four pieces of literature but does not engage in the wider literature on the topic, the current debates and discussions - nor does it locate the primary contribution of the paper
- Methods section isn't clear on some key points - how were respondents chosen, why was the study undertaken, what is meant by "the positivist technique" - positivism is a broad approach; the methods section is also written in a mixture of past and future tense which is confusing. The first part of the results and discussion section repeats (and in some cases contradicts) largely what is in the methods section. It also mentions an online survey - which should be included in the methods section. However there are no details as to who was surveyed, how they were selected; how many people responded etc
- There is some discussion of the theory that was used for analysis but not clear what that theory was?