

# Review of: "Pedogenic Characterization of Alluvium Derived Soils in the Arid Region of Rajasthan, India"

Dipendu Guha

**Potential competing interests:** No potential competing interests to declare.

Mr. Joshi has posted a revised version of the manuscript earlier submitted for publication. The author was asked to mention the soil mineralogical composition, which he has not provided. Nevertheless, Mr. Joshi has incorporated the elemental composition of different horizons of soil profiles, which helps in identifying the chemistry of the soil profiles. However, soil minerals are used to infer the weathering rates of surficial materials; help in determining the age of soils and sediments; elucidate the mechanisms of soil formation; and reconstruct the paleoenvironmental conditions during pedogenesis. So, the enumeration of soil mineralogy will enhance the value of this paper submitted for publication. The author is advised to add soil mineralogy or mineralogical composition of the soil profiles so that the theme of the paper is justified. The paper is recommended after incorporation of the soil mineralogy of different soil horizons by the author and a discussion of the matter in the discussion and conclusions parts of the paper.