

Review of: "Ecosystem Services Inequality Driven by Agroextractivism in Salamina, Colombia: A Critical Institutional Analysis"

Jorge Urdapilleta¹

¹ Centro de Investigación Científica de Yucatán

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

This article makes an excellent theoretical revision in order to explain the conflicts related with Hass Avocado plantations in Salamina Colombia. It gives some very usefull concepts and criteria to analyse problems related with agricultural regime. I considere that its "weakness" of opportunity area, is to give more field data that supports its exposition. You can use from academic papers to online news. We didnt see the disparities using statistics, only the authors inference.

Since this article shows conflicts within a territory, this concept must be defined, as well as others such as Power and Regime.

I consider that with some small details it could be published.

Some more specific comments:

In Mexico I made some data analysis that showed how the amount of acres used for corn and beans has been substituted with berries, avocado and some other gourmet products that are not accesible to the majority of the population. I recommend to include some graphs that could show land uses changes and determine at what percentage the avocado plantations belongs to big owners and in what extent it belongs to small farmers (1 to 5 ha).

In your article you mention "Complaints have been raised regarding issues such as displacement, land grabbing, and damage to water resources. These concerns highlight

the social and environmental impacts associated with the expansion of avocado production." In order to illustraet this at a global scale, you should consider how some other countries have been seriously affected by massive avocado plantations, because of the huge water demand. Please make some references in order to have a better picture of the effects on the ecosystems in different parts of the globe (you could check what has happened in Michoacan, Mexico, and in California, US. Also in Peru. Here you can find some statistics

<https://es.statista.com/estadisticas/1263632/mayores-exportadores-de-aguacate-en-el-mundo/>

In the section “Biophysical and Material”, I think it would be very useful to include some maps. In case there are problems related with water pollution, you should mention it. In Mexico there are huge avocado plantations that uses a lot of agrochemicals that endanger peasants health.

A critical approach to the win-win discourse has been given by Raul Garcia Barrios, with the category of “Strategic Cooperation”. I think it could enrich your discussion.

<https://docplayer.es/108731412-1-la-cooperacion-estrategica-una-introduccion-al-debate.html>

For the discourse analysis, it would be useful to include some quotes of the actors point of view. Do you have some testimonys given by big companies and by small farmers? Include some references to news and other not academic sources that illustrate the conflicts among water and land use.

YOU mentioned “the involvement of external companies from Peru, Chile, and Colombia in Salamina’s rapid land adquisitio”, please give statistics.

When mentioning the “regressive pattern in nature’s utilization, resulting in simplified landscapes and biodiversity loss, particularly in the Global South”, it would be usefull to include some specific references to that kind of patterns, such as PalmOil in Centeramerica, mining, extensive use for hybryd corn and some others.

<https://www.infobae.com/estados-unidos/2023/11/29/crimen-organizado-y-devastacion-ambiental-el-lado-oscuro-de-los-aguacates-que-se-comen-en-estados-unidos/>

https://elpais.com/elpais/2019/03/21/planeta_futuro/1553160674_048784.html

<https://desinformemonos.org/el-acaparamiento-de-agua-por-parte-de-la-industria-alimentaria-deja-a-las-comunidades-sin-una-gota/>

In table 1. Characteristics of the participants in the Social Situation

Please give the percentage of land owned by each one of the “participants”.

In order to strentghen the power relations analysis, it is important to give a solid definition of power. Maybe Crozier’s or Foucaults could be usefull. In terms of territorial disputes, Milton Sants definition is crucial to understand this dynamycs.

In order to understand the conflicts in a wider scale, the concept Local Socioenvironmental Systems and the analysis of Regime influences, made by Manuel Parra, would be quite usefull.

<https://www.amazon.com/Socio-Environmental-Regimes-Local-Visions-Transdisciplinary/dp/3030497666>

