

Review of: "A Review of Prosody, Punctuation, and Dyslexia: Implications for the Use of Speech Technologies"

Anna Pavlova¹

¹ Johannes-Gutenberg Universität Mainz

Potential competing interests: The author(s) declared that no potential competing interests exist.

Dear Author, the topic of Your paper is very important und valuable. There is an acute need for extra punctuation training for dyslexics, indeed. But some premises are wrong in this paper. The most important is the idea that "Prosody is manifested in writing through punctuation." In the article, the levels of prosody and punctuation are equated. This idea is obsolete, it is not valid in the light of modern research. It is unclear how this amateurish view can find its way into a scientific article against the background of the numerous scientific papers that refute it. Every language has its own rules for punctuation. In English, a comma must separate the subject from the predicate, while in Russian it is generally forbidden. Even in German punctuation, separating the subject and predicate is not common. But there is no evidence that prosody in English is different from prosody in Russian or in German when it comes to pauses between the group of the subject and that of the predicate. In Russian, some modal words such as maybe, possibly, probably must be separated by commas according to the rules of punctuation, while their synonyms are to be inserted into the sentence without commas; the prosody of the separated words does not differ in any way from that of the non-separated words.

The presented recent findings of intonation research prove that pauses in speech play at best only a subordinate role in the constitution of prosodic phrases and for this reason are rather marginal for the relationship between comma and intonation.

Missing from the list of secondary literature are titles of Christopher Sappok's research, which is devoted to the subject of punctuation in didactics.

What does the concept "non-linguistic prosody" mean?

As a language teacher, I also notice that the insufficient knowledge and competence in punctuation is not only found in dyslexics, but in almost all students who come to university straight from the classroom. It seems that not much importance is attached to the rules of punctuation at school. It may be that modern ways of communication (sms etc.) influence it that commas and other signs are no longer perceived as something important. It would be good to address this side of the issue as well and possibly draw comparisons between dyslexics and non-dyslexics in this regard. I am not sure that serious differences between these groups would be observed.

Nevertheless, the topic addressed in the article remains topical and important. Only I would recommend separating the topic of punctuation from the topic of prosody. They are two different competences that only partly overlap.