

Review of: "Weathering changes – livelihood adaptation to weather shocks in rural India by disadvantaged social groups"

Adway Mitra¹

¹ Indian Institute of Technology Kharagpur

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

A fairly detailed and meticulous study on a highly relevant topic. The following are a few points that I would like to point out:

Related to research:

1. What are the two waves that are used for the analysis? I did not see any definition of these waves
2. There should be a subsection for notations, where the indices like 'i' and 'j' used in the equations should be explained, and also variables like Z
3. Does the regression-based model represent the causal impact of wetness/dryness on migration? It could be that migration is anyway increasing, irrespective of climate change. For making a causal statement, it is useful to consider Granger Causality, to check if the prediction of migration improves by considering the climate related factors, vis-a-vis not considering them
4. What is the reason of choosing the regression model? Could other predictive models like decision tree, or a Bayesian Model have worked?
5. How about the destinations of migrations? Does the dataset contain it? Can we get the statistics of which districts received most migrants from which districts? Does the choice of destination vary among social groups?

Related to writing:

1. The caption of Fig 4 mentions dry and wet months, but the legends inside the figures mentions only dry months
2. A few sentences are not correctly formed. The author should use a grammar checking software
3. The captions and row/column headings of Tables 2 and 3 are not clear. They are explained in the main text, but tables should be more self-sufficient. For Tables 4 onwards, these become even more complex and difficult to comprehend.
4. Phrases like "the poor" should be avoided

Overall, I think the paper has a lot of potential, but the methodology, analysis and writing need to be more crisp and transparent.

