

Review of: "Pedogenic Characterization of Alluvium-Derived Soils in the Arid Region of Rajasthan, India"

Sandipan Ghosh

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

The following suggestions are given to improve the manuscript:

- Pedogenic concretions of Indian soils have immense importance in palaeoclimatic study. If you provide some insights, it will be much more fruitful for readers.
- The introduction section is very short. Please include key research issues, literature review, research gaps, and main objectives.
- Agricultural importance and biomass growth of calcareous soils are the main points of interest in the regional economy. Please pay attention to this.
- Pedogenic processes are important, but the regional impact of this soil should be mentioned.
- A less geo-chemical study of pedogenic concretions (calcrete) is observed. The author should give more emphasis to this aspect. Mega-scopic and micro-scopic studies are needed here.
- A map of the study area with other soil maps is needed for real ground observation.
- Log profiles of soils should be given with field photographs.
- Sample size and sample site descriptions are missing.
- If any correlations and regressions of morphological parameters are calculated, please include them.
- The paper more looks like a general pedogenic description of arid soil rather than a research paper. Please give new findings.
- Dating data of soil sediments (OSL dating) can be given to understand the genesis.