Review of: "School instability in South Africa: a Systematic Review of Reflections and Experiences for a way forward"

Hanneke du Preez¹

¹ University of Pretoria

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Thank you for writing an insightful argumentative essay on the instabilities in the South African school system with a focus on KwaZulu Natal. From the content, it is clear that the authors are personally involved in this school system and bravely attempted to engage with what is known about the topic. The concept of Ubuntu was given as a possible road map to stability in the schooling system.

However, I have to raise a number of concerns:

1. The authors stated that the essay was based on a literature review. This is totally acceptable. When applying a literature review the following is of vital importance. One, you need to find sources within the last 5 years. The study must be recent. In the Introduction, a statement was made that the information was “recent”, however the source was 4 years old and can therefore not be seen as “recent”. Two, a literature review is based on sources that are cited in the essay. You have very limited citations in the essay. This is a problem. Three, you can not base your entire essay on research from 2012 – 2015. This is too old for an essay published on an open platform. I suggest that you search for the absolute latest information available. Four, there are numerous statements without references. The trustworthiness of your essay is dependent on references to existing and published research. You provided very little evidence of this.

2. The flow of thoughts in your document must be improved. This means that one concept should lead to the next. This is really difficult to get right and one needs to practice often and purposefully to do this.

3. Your discussion for Figure 4, indicated that a sample of students were used. I assume that you refer to the study sourced at the end of the figure. Please cite the source in-text otherwise it seems that you used questionnaires as a research method.

In conclusion, research needs to be evidence-based. I am afraid that this essay is argumentative with insufficient evidence.