Review of: "Trust is the best policy. Game theoretical analysis of bias in elicitation procedures in linguistics"

Jiateng Pan[1]

1 Tokyo Institute of Technology

Title and authors:

Trust is the best policy. Game theoretical analysis of bias in elicitation procedures in linguistics

Hubert Kowalewski

Summary:

In this thesis, 6 elicitation games are presented and analyzed. Based on a search for Nash equilibria, it is concluded that accepting the judgement of consultants with 67% probability is the best strategy when unbiased, positively biased, and negatively biased consultants are equally likely. Also, considering the actual situation, accepting consultants' judgement completely is an acceptable strategy.

Major essential revisions:

In the "1. Introduction" section, the purpose of the study is not explicitly mentioned, as any study needs to state its purpose.

In the second paragraph of the "6. Conclusion" section, it was written that " Most probably, the group of negatively biased consultants should "weigh" less statistically relative to the two other groups, especially in self-elicitation." This cannot be found in the previous section.

Minor essential revisions:

The "6. Conclusion" section is too brief and does not summarize the results of the six games throughout the text, and a systematic summary of the results of the analysis is needed.

Discretionary revisions:

At the end of "3. The elicitation game" and "4. Should we trust ourselves?" sections, a summary of the game analysis for that section can be added so that the reader can better understand the conclusion of "6. Conclusion" section.

Confidential comments:

The article has no ethics-related issues.

Recommendations:

Publish with major revision