

Review of: "Comparative Analysis of Sustainable Livestock Development as a Source of Livelihood to Farmers of Maharashtra and Jammu and Kashmir"

Arvind Sharma¹

¹ University of Queensland

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Reviewer comments on manuscript entitled 'Comparative Analysis of Sustainable Livestock Development as a Source of Livelihood to Farmers of Maharashtra and Jammu and Kashmir'

General comments

A good attempt by the author on the situation of livestock husbandry in Jammu & Kashmir and Maharashtra. The author has shown figures from the latest census but I could not find any comparative analysis of sustainable livestock development in the two states. I could only see the elaboration of census data. No livestock development has been discussed and compared in the manuscript. Moreover, the discussion does not focus on the two states but is a generalized version of livestock production/husbandry in India. Similarly, the bottlenecks and constraints listed are not specific to these states. I could see repeated self-citation by the author that is not ethical. I am sorry, I cannot recommend the publication of the manuscript.

Specific comments

Abstract

Please delete 'This research focuses on the development of livestock and related issues in two Indian states.'

Please replace 'these two states' with 'in the states of Jammu and Kashmir and Maharashtra.'

Please replace 'standing' by 'growth.'

Please replace 'cattle' with 'animal husbandry.'

Please replace 'in livestock specie-mix' with 'in the animal husbandry sector.'

Introduction

Please delete 'many.'

Livestock population dynamics

Please elaborate this line clearly: 'These factors have helped both states' populations remain healthy.'

Adoption of cross-bred/improved animals in both the states

Please insert a reference to strengthen this point: 'Crossbreeding is an important tool for achieving a rapid and long-term increase in productivity and production in livestock species that are economically significant.'

This is not a correct term 'semi-arid moist.' Please clarify or delete it.

Table 2 does not support this assertion: 'Compared to arid and semiarid systems, the percentage of crossbred cattle, sheep, and pigs is higher in semi-arid moist and coastal climates.'

Growth of veterinary institutions in Maharashtra and Jammu and Kashmir

The tables 6 & 7 show negative growth trends of veterinary institutions in both states, which is in contrast to your assertion 'There are now significantly more veterinary hospitals, veterinary dispensaries, polyclinics, and veterinary aid centers, stockmen centers, and mobile dispensaries due to increased plan allocation, new livestock development schemes, and growing animal ethics concerns'. Please clarify.

Planning and Fiscal Support

Livestock development schemes/programmes in Maharashtra and Jammu and Kashmir

Please clarify this assertion 'These initiatives have improved animal comfort'.