

# Review of: "[Commentary] Explaining Hamas Attack of October 7"

Shaul Bartal<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Bar-Ilan University

**Potential competing interests:** No potential competing interests to declare.

I think this is a good article and worthy of publication, but I think it is necessary to clarify some points that the author ignored and, in my opinion, must refer to them.

1. The attack was not only on Kibbutz Kfar Aza. All the surrounding settlements were attacked. In Kibbutz Nir Am, out of 400 residents, 100 were murdered or kidnapped. In Baeri, there was also a massive murder, and at the Nova party, there were 364 dead. At least 1200 people were murdered in different places, most of them civilians. The State Department defined this as the largest massacre of the Jewish people since the Holocaust. Any article dealing with October 7th should state the events that happened. This is not a one-off intelligence failure on Israel's part, but a real disaster and a crazy failure.

2. The abductees were not mentioned at all in the article, a disturbing point considering that this is the attribution scenario of Israel and the IDF, and that in every conflict, Hamas will try to kidnap soldiers as a bargaining chip, as was done with Gilad Shalit. No one expected that Hamas would also kidnap women, babies, and the elderly - this was definitely a mistake and a lack of appreciation of the capabilities of the Hamas organization.

3. Beyond not describing the atrocities and murders of Hamas, including the rape of women and other sexual assaults, it seems that the author ignores the ideology of the organization that wants to destroy Israel at all costs, without considering at all the heavy price that the Palestinian people are paying and will continue to pay in the foreseeable future due to the brutal attack of Hamas.

4. The descriptions of Israel's lack of intelligence preparation, lack of appreciation of the enemy's capabilities, and the starting point that the defense line will always be breached are all correct. The forces that stopped the Hamas raid in the first hours were very small and were not prepared for the invasion of 3000 terrorists into Israel. I would add another analysis here: why Israel did not regularly prepare sufficient forces to contain such a scenario.