

# Review of: "Environmental Representations in Rocky Records in National Parks in Southeastern Piauí – Brazil"

Sara Garcês

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

General notes:

The English is literal. A good review of the article by a native speaker is mandatory.

The third paragraph is completely unnecessary in the theme of the article. The main goal of this paper according to the authors was and I quote: "This article aims to demonstrate the relationship between the environment in the past and present in the region of the Serra da Capivara and Serra das Confusões National Parks, based on rock art in order to demonstrate the concerns of past human groups with the environment they inhabited.

Throughout the article, loose phrases relating to the environment are made without any connection to the rock art. Only the fact that there are representations of possible plant representations is pointed out but nothing more is developed to meet the objective outlined by the article at the beginning of it.

The bibliographical references are mostly old and outdated and the few more recent ones (2018 and 2021) seem to have been put there by force and without much sense and continuously repeated.

Several issues are initiated but kept very much on the surface, with no connection between them and no developments.

Several notes are made to many of the authors' phrases but overall, I think this article says a lot but nothing new or interesting. There is no consistency in the arguments and overall, it is all rather confusing to understand the focus and logic of the text. The English really needs a revision by a native speaker because the translation seems to have been done verbatim.

For these reasons I do not consider this article to be fit for publication.

Notes:

In the sentence:

*Archaeology has this role as science: rescuing from the unconsciousness of the Earth, revealing the complex and former life forms and how human relationships are found through the archaeological remains, among them the rock art, especially, the paintings.*

Reviewer: I don't understand this part: *unconsciousness of the Earth*. What does this mean? And why especially

paintings? What does it make it different from engravings?

In the sentence:

*But what brings us back to rock art? What can it reveal to us as scientific data or as a subject of study? Is there any mathematics in the drawings? There is, what we can observe, some premeditated outlines in the drawings and the rocky environment that was chosen by the person. In Figure 2, which was registered in a shelter under a rock in Toca do Baixão do Milho, Serra das Confusões National Park, in the municipality of Caracol, southwest of Piauí, we may observe registers in this type of proposal.*

Reviewer: What is the proposal? That there are premeditated outlines in the drawings and the rocky environment that was chosen by the person? This idea is not new.

In this sentence:

*This site, with sandstone rock formation and large dimensions, and located in the southeast of Piauí state, presents a series of rock representations with a recognizable topic which is associated with animals, non-humans, and humans, besides the phytomorphic representations, which is an important piece of evidence of the human adaptation to the environment and its resource uses (Figures 3).*

Reviewer: How a suppose phytomorphic image stands as an important piece of evidence of the human adaptation to the environment and its resource uses? Please elaborate.

In the sentence:

*Despite the results obtained at BPF during the excavations from 1978 to 1988 that have been published since 2001 (PARENTI, 2001; SANTOS et al., 2002; VALLADAS et al., 2003; CHAVES et al., 2006), most of the current publishing do not consider the data beforementioned. Such publishing prefers to concentrate on criticism of a generic and conjectural set of taphonomy and technological observations, ignoring the existence of the archaeological site itself when considering the settlement issue (VIALOU et al., 2017).*

Reviewer: Which current publishing? Only one reference?

In this sentence:

The landscape category, which has an important tradition for French geography, presents a wide application in several scientific areas.

Reviewer: Which scientific areas? References?

In this sentence:

*Besides that, the concept of landscape is polysemic and supported by several epistemological views, from insights into material and immaterial dimensions in space dynamics.*

Reviewer: References?

In this sentence:

*There was some sort of meaning deletion of several representations that can be found in rock art by the colonization process, by the time or by the weather. As a consequence, the meaning emptying of those old symbols is an obstacle to promoting their spontaneous appreciation by contemporary society, which entails a lack of interest and mobilization to preserve, distancing from the regional identity and ignorance in relation to their own past*

Reviewer: This is very confusing and absolutely without references.

In this sentence:

*Specifically, in the piauiense (you can't use this in English) backlands and in the surrounding regions to the sites described here, there are some dwellers who still keep common habits to ancient peoples, for example, hunting, collection (what is collection), gathering and intimate relationships with their place of origin. Reflecting on this makes us notice the still existing links between the past and the present, through the customs, the relationships with nature and the local landscape.*

Reviewer: English must be review; and what do you mean with this: intimate relationships with their place of origin? Must be explained.

In this sentence:

*Rock art (rock engraving and painting) is one of the archaeological pieces of evidence that generates more doubts than certainties in the life of archaeologists, which promotes the development of hypotheses and interpretations about it. Many archaeologists argue that those types of evidence would help to try to tell the history of our ancestors, hunter- gatherer groups (which is more rooted in the popular concept – the hunting scene). Others consider the time accounting (what?), astronomy or even the geographical location as 'maps of villages' (BUCO et al. 2010). Therefore, in each case, there could be different purposes. With those pieces of evidence, it is possible to observe the relationship between human beings and the environment from the moment they were looking for raw material: ochre (denomination that is used by archaeologists for iron oxide)(this is not the denomination of ochre; And if you say so, according to whom?, goethite and hematite, and others to perform painting and engraving on more resistant rocks. The choice of place and what to present on the rocky wall would be linked, in some cases, to the environment as discussed by Fagundes et al. (2018). You lack more references. You keep using the same and only one.*

In this sentence:

*Regarding the rock supports, these representations are often studied as simple images, representations, or iconography, (by whom?) obliterating the material aspects of those visual manifestations. For the archaeological taphonomy, this information is important because the weathering process is an almost non-existing analysis factor for rock art in Brazil, which is more developed in other countries (references?), but they form through a different process (which*

ones?), and they deteriorate through the universal weathering process.

In this sentence:

*The phytomorph artwork is the one in which pictures can be observed that seem to be vegetation and in the representative structure of the rocky walls; they are in the shapes of trees, leaves and/ or branches which can be observed at Serra da Capivara as well as Serra das Confusões (Figures 4 and 5). It is possible to reflect somehow on the vegetable importance for the basic sense of subsistence as well as for other aspects of the daily life of individuals (what is the importance? Where is the reflection?).*

In this sentence:

The fieldwork and the research done by Almeida (2011) allowed us to establish that rock painting can be more considered as an instrument in the reconstruction of an environment in the past time. This statement could be reached through comparisons, analysis, and interpretations of zoomorph rock painting. *(So, why don't you do it?).* As an example, Almeida, Etchebehere and Rampaneli (2017) indicate that the paleontological evidence dating of *Blastocerus dichotomus* (Figure 8) (KINOSHITA *et al.*, 2014), fauna that is represented in several rock registers in the park (CAMPOS & BUCO, 2021), allowed to infer that the region of the study, from 20 to 25 thousand B.P., was wetter than currently, with floodplains and flooded areas. This paleoenvironmental characterization matches the data of paleoclimate and paleo vegetation that were studied by Santos (2007), which establish that there was retraction start of rainforests 18,000 YR B.P.

In this sentence:

In other archaeological sites which are ~~located~~ in the ~~Piauiense~~ Piauí territory, we can also find the recurrence of phytomorphic, zoomorphic and biomorphic representations, which reinforces the hypothesis that such elements had certain importance for the ancient inhabitants in this territory, to the point when they portrayed themselves in their rock art.

Reviewer: *Yes, but in Serra da Capivara there a lot of representations. If they represented, it is obvious that all is important for the artist. What is the novelty in your sentence?*

The presence of scenes with human beings around trees, which are interpreted as rituals, gives us an idea that ancient peoples of those zones fostered a relationship of respect and devotion to the trees and to the native biome.

Reviewer: *How do you know that? What if the tree element was just an element of a complex ritual? And the significance of this image is related to the ritual itself and not the elements that compose them?*

The same relationship of respect, intimacy and sacralization (what are the aspects on this image that you see all this?) can be noticed in the scenes of interaction among men (*only men?*) and animals, especially the images that portray biomorphs: men with antlers, winged men, and other similar ones.

In this sentence:

The zoomorph and phytomorph representations on rock art at Serra da Capivara and Confusões seem to differ in quantitative and technical terms. *What are those differences?* We can find the characteristic low-relief figures at Serra das Confusões, with more straight lines. Despite the geographical proximity, maybe the rock art production was made by different human groups or in different periods, but with similar motivations for their artistic representations, both bring common images of the local landscape, including plants and animals.

Figure 12 is of low-quality. Hard to see the motifs. Also figure 15A.

In this sentence:

It has been found some evidence of rock art in Serra do Roncador, which has been little studied in the indigenous territory of Pimentel Barbosa, Mato Grosso, Brazil.

Reviewer: *What does this as to do with the theme of the paper?*

Until today, science has not been able to solve the riddle and to establish the absolute truth about human creation and existence. ???

It also has doubts about the capacity of creating and producing the beforementioned art as a register of the way of living due to the geometric and mathematical features found (*what features?*), as well as in other ancient cultures in the world, such as Mayan, Incan and Egyptian.

Reviewer: *What does this as to do with the theme of the paper?*

In these sentences:

Much before 1,500, the first inhabitants of Brazil tried to represent useful aspects of their daily life, so in the past, those ancestral beings with other ways of life had different ways of seeing, acting, and thinking so they registered such facts on rocks. (*we don't know if these images were facts*). Giving the due importance, reverence, they registered their knowledge about the environment which is, doubtless, the great message left by that population that was living on *terras brasílicas*. The two Piauiense parks, as well as other regions in the country and in the world, present enough conditions to be the ancestor memory repositor which we can support on.

The paths are memory as well as environmental traces due to the recognition of certain plant species that through a creative process lead to the process of negotiation reinvention (*what do you mean with this?*) with the environment and then forming a new way of life. Societies are not recovered by archaeology, but there are questions about which elements were considered to maintain botanical preferences.

There is the emergence and importance of realising, debating and reflecting on the environment, and then it is necessary to create, act, and move towards sustainability between humanity and surrounding areas.

Reviewer: *What does this as to do with the theme of the paper?*

Knowledge is absorbed while studying and uncovering groups that lived and moved along the territories where the population is currently, especially from the Brazilian parks Serra da Capivara and Serra das Confusões which offer resources and material to reflect and understand the human groups and their territories at issue, what maybe may change our ways to deal with the environment.

Reviewer: *What does this as to do with the theme of the paper?*