

# Review of: "Questioning the Moratorium on Synthetic Phenomenology"

Shoji Nagataki<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Chukyo University

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

The reviewer does not intend to strongly disagree with the author's criticism of Metzinger. The author criticizes Metzinger, who states that the development and study of synthetic phenomenology should be banned until 2050 based on conceptual speculative arguments. This is because "conceptual discussions may be fruitful, in claims on reality asking for real action, pure conceptual claims will not do." The author's argument is very clear and understandable. The author's criticism of Metzinger's argument is that it mixes factual assumptions with speculative assumptions. The author criticizes Metzinger's argument using the concept of category mistake.

It is orthodox in both good and bad ways. However, this paper is no more and no less. While the author's argument is sound, I personally have the impression that there could be further development in this paper.

We may find criticism of Metzinger in a different direction from the author. It does not dare to impose a moratorium on conscious artifacts on the assumption that they will eventually be developed, but rather to seek ways to build a social relationship between them and us. In other words, it is about developing a new moral conception for a society of diverse entities.

I would like to add one more point. Since pain is purely personal and first-person, it is only an intuitive guess as to whether someone other than oneself feels similar pain to oneself. That artificial systems do not feel pain is also supported by circumstantial evidence. The author seems to be assuming that there are no present (and future?) artifacts that feel pain, but the reviewer feels that the author needs further exploration as to what pain is. I would like to see further development of the discussion of the first-person character of pain that was briefly mentioned in v.1 of this paper.