

Review of: "Mediumship for Pets: A Pilot Study With a Triple-Blind Protocol"

Helané Wahbeh¹

¹ Research, Institute of Noetic Sciences, Petaluma, United States

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

This is a novel and triple-blind study evaluating information received from mediums about deceased pets. Overall, it is a very interesting study extending mediumship research to animals. There are some aspects of the reporting that could be improved.

1. In general, the paper would benefit from editing for grammar, punctuation, etc.
2. There appears to be a mismatch between the information described in the Procedures and the presented Results. The results seem to focus on comparisons between pet readings and human readings, but this research question is not mentioned at all in the procedures. The authors even mention results supporting hypotheses in the Results section, but no hypotheses are outlined in the Procedure section. The section "Statistical Comparisons" in the results is confusing because this was not described as an a priori analysis. Was this a planned comparison or done post hoc? Regardless, the methods for the analysis should be included in the Procedure section if you want to include the comparison in the Results. Alternatively, it could be introduced and described in the Discussion section as a comparison to what has been done in the existing literature. The paper would benefit from having clear research questions and hypotheses outlined, along with the specific statistical analyses that were used to evaluate them.
3. The Discussion section is very short and does not fully address the comparison with previous work, implications of the study, all the limitations, suggestions for future research, conclusions, or practical implications. I understand there have been no previous studies exactly on this topic, but you could include the comparison to human sessions in the Discussion or tie in anecdotal evidence for animal spirits, etc. There is a great deal more information about human-animal spiritual relationships that could be integrated into the Discussion (and also in the Introduction for establishing the rationale for the study). It would also be very interesting to tie in the idea of the survival of consciousness and the various types of consciousness (i.e., animal vs human). What would additional positive studies say about consciousness in general?