

Review of: "Stock Estimation Trial From Spatio-temporal Limited Data of Six Commercial Species in the Middle Madeira River, Southwest Amazon"

Deepak Singh¹

¹ Hemwati Nandan Bahuguna Garhwal University

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Title: Estimating the Fish Stock of Six Commercial Species in the Middle Madeira River, Southwest Amazon.

The present study regarding the stock assessment of commercially important species is an important contribution by the authors. However, keeping in view the collected data, it can be considered a short communication. I suggest the following points to improve the quality of the manuscript.

Introduction:

- More information about the current status of Amazon fish stocks and population parameters may be included.
- The patterns of the references given in the text and the reference list differ, which should be similar throughout the whole manuscript.
- Some information regarding natural and anthropogenic disturbances likely to affect the production, catchability, and population dynamics of the fishes in the Amazon region should also be included.

Materials and Methods:

- Details of sampling sites' characteristics should also be included as they may differ at different landing sites.
- The presence of the total number of species caught from the Middle Madeira River and the basis of selection of the given six commercial species should be added.

Results and Discussion:

- It needs a detailed description of the results represented by the figures and table. Results seem to be scanty.
- Even after very low r^2 values, the p values are highly significant. I think the calculations should be revalidated.
- It is nowhere mentioned figure 2 and its proper caption under figure(s).
- The plot regarding maximum sustainable yield (Lorenzen et al. (2016) parable will be more suitable, if possible, to draw with the present data.
- The calculation of <7% exploration rate of the estimated fish population should be detailed to clear.
- The measurement units should be included regarding efforts and estimated population.
- The discussion part may be strengthened by including comparisons with other similar studies and an explanation of the

cause of deviation, if any.