

Review of: "Analyzing the Effects of Organic Amendments on Soil Erosion Dynamics: A Comprehensive Study on Application Methods and Timing"

Lucas Rauber¹

¹ Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Dear colleagues,

The article is interesting, as it demonstrates experimental results of soil loss by water erosion under different conditions. However, the work still lacks some methodological details and greater discussion of the results. Below are general and specific comments.

Introduction

The ideas in the introduction are presented adequately.

Methodology

Soil classification needs to be presented.

It is important to present more details of the analysis procedures. It is not clear, for example, whether the particle size analyses were carried out on the soil contained in the boxes or on the sediment.

Furthermore, is there a characterization of the spatial variability of soil texture in this soil that could affect the results? What is the particle size distribution at different depths? Is there a uniform distribution that allows the effect of time to be adequately analyzed?

It is also necessary to better characterize the simulated precipitation, such as duration, average intensity, return period, and erosivity.

Results and discussion

The authors seem to confuse "erosion" with "soil loss." Considering the protocol used, erosion was not measured directly. Only soil loss was quantified.

There is a lack of further discussion about the factors and mechanisms that explain the difference between treatments.

