Review of: "Achieving Sustainability in Smart Cities Mission in India through Universities' Innovation in India"

Taruna Bansal[1]

1 Jamia Millia Islamia

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

The paper aims to explore the relationship between economic development, innovation, and sustainability in the context of smart cities, with a focus on the role of engineering institutions in India. The study utilizes secondary data from sources such as the NITI Aayog and the Institute for Competitiveness to analyze the rankings of states and union territories based on sustainable development goals (SDGs) and innovation indices. The research also incorporates insights from previous studies on universities' involvement in smart city initiatives.

The review maintains a constructive tone, focusing on the strengths of the paper and its contributions to the field. It appreciates the paper's recognition of the importance of engineering institutions in the development of sustainable smart cities and suggests avenues for future research, demonstrating engagement with the topic. The review also provides a balanced perspective, noting the limitations of the study and areas that could be further explored.

In conclusion, the review effectively captures the main points of the paper while maintaining a constructive and encouraging tone. It highlights the strengths of the study and offers suggestions for improvement and future research directions.

What can be improved?

1. Provide a clear introduction: Start the paper with a concise and engaging introduction that clearly states the objectives of the study and the importance of the topic. This will help readers understand the context and purpose of the research.
2. Expand the literature review: While the paper briefly mentions the experience of the 'living lab' of Barcelona, it would be beneficial to provide a more comprehensive review of existing literature on sustainable smart cities, innovation, and the role of engineering institutions. This can include studies, theories, and best practices from both national and international sources.
3. Methodological details: Provide more detailed information about the methodology used in the study. Explain the process of data collection, selection of variables, and any statistical techniques employed. This will enhance the rigor and transparency of the research.
4. Data analysis: Present the results of the Spearman's Rank Correlation Coefficient analysis in a clear and concise manner. Discuss the limitations of the analysis and potential implications.
5. Discuss the impact of COVID-19: In the section on the future of smart cities, elaborate on the specific challenges and

opportunities presented by the COVID-19 pandemic. Discuss how the pandemic has affected the concept of smart cities, including the need for digital connectivity, remote work, and resilient infrastructure.

6. Case studies and practical examples: Include case studies or practical examples of successful sustainable smart city initiatives from different regions or countries.
7. Policy recommendations: Based on the findings of the study, provide concrete policy recommendations for government bodies, engineering institutions, and other stakeholders involved in smart city development. These recommendations should focus on promoting sustainable innovation, collaboration between academia and industry, and inclusive planning to address the needs of marginalized groups.
8. Conclusion and future research: Summarize the main findings of the study and restate their significance in relation to sustainable smart cities. Highlight any gaps in knowledge or avenues for further research in the field. This will encourage future exploration and contribute to the ongoing discourse on smart city development.

By incorporating these suggestions, the paper can be enhanced to provide a more comprehensive analysis of the relationship between economic development, innovation, and sustainability in the context of smart city planning.