

Review of: "Uptake of ^{15}N -urea and phosphates in *Triticum aestivum* with *Pseudomonas putida* and *Rhizophagus irregularis* endophytes of calcareous soil weeds"

Tualar Simarmata¹

¹ Universitas Padjadjaran

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Review & Comments for article: PCVCOX (Prof. Dr. Tualar Simarmata)

Title: Uptake of ^{15}N -urea and phosphates in *Triticum aestivum* with *Pseudomonas putida* and *Rhizophagus irregularis* endophytes of calcareous soil weeds

Overall, the MS needs a major revision and proofed by professional proofers.

See suggestion below:

	Comments	Suggestions
Title	<p>The title is too long</p> <p>Need to refine and reflect the whole contents of MS</p>	<p>Make clear dependent and independent variables?. Suggested title: Improving Nutrient (^{15}N- and P-Uptake) and Wheat Grain Yield by Inoculating with <i>Pseudomonas putida</i> and <i>Rhizophagus irregularis</i> in Greenhouse</p>
Abstract	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Need to concisely. Rewrite/Rearrange and summarize the abstract (follow the guidance) 	<p>Abstract maximum 200 words. Please follow the author guidance and write concisely:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Short Background (Main problem or the importance of this work) Objective: The study was done to investigated Methods. Resaerch Design and data collected Results and main conclusions:
Introduction	<p>Introduction is unclear</p> <p>Need to be improved , Rewritten and rearranged systematically</p>	<p>The important this Research (main Issue)</p> <p>The the current problem at hand and the corresponding efforts to resolve i. State of the art. What is Proposed solution. The use biofertilizer (<i>Pseudomonas putida</i> and <i>Rhizophagus irregularis</i>). Explain briefly and clearly the roles and its traits. State of the art and explain the novelty of this research</p>
		<p>Re-write and Rearrange systematically</p> <p>2.1. Site description</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Agroecological characters (climate, elevation etc. or Greenhouse Soil Properties (chemical and physical properties <p>2.2. Characteristic and ability of used inoculant</p>

Material & Methods	Need to be re-written and rearranged systematically and concisely	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Describe briefly the source, characteristic and ability of <i>Pseudomonas putida</i> and <i>Rhizophagus irregularis</i>. Explain and describe how do you get the inoculant. Explain in detail the isolation and selection procedure of this rhizobacteria and Mycorrhiza from weeds (Name the weed) <i>Bimolecularly identification of these inoculant</i> <p>2.3. Experimental Design and Field Management</p> <p>a. Research design: explain briefly and clearly</p> <p>b. Plot size and application of treatment</p> <p>c. Observed responds</p> <p>2.3. Crop Maintenances and management: explain briefly and clearly</p> <p>2.4. Soil sampling and plant analyses</p> <p>2.5. Statistical Analyses</p>
Results	Overall, the sentences need to be improved; refining the sentences Placed the wheat grain yield at the end	<p>Provide a clear and concise title that accurately represents the content of the graph. Figure 1 move material and methods</p> <p>Figure 2. Effect of on N-and P205 uptake (make clear is this ¹⁵N)</p> <p>Figure 3: The wheat grain yields due to inoculation of at different</p>
Discussion	Need to be Rewritten and arranged systematically	Overall, the sentences need to be improved. Use all measured data to support the in discussing this 15 Nutrient uptake and grain yield
Conclusion	Need to be Rewritten and refocused	Pay attention on the aims of this research. The conclusion should be focused to answer the problems or in line with the objective this research. The last sentence should what is the main finding or recommendation of this research

Overall, this MS need major revision and the acceptance will be considered after revision

signed

Prof. Dr. Tualar Simarmata