

Review of: "Tourists' Activities and their Impacts on Chinhoyi Caves Heritage Site, Zimbabwe"

W.A.D. Mahaulpatha¹

¹ University of Sri Jayawardenapura

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Overview: I find that this manuscript is written more like a thesis in general and less like a manuscript to be published in a peer-reviewed journal (e.g.: Tourist activities, Statement of the problem, Research objective, numbering etc). However, since I do not know for what journal, this manuscript is intended for, I will not discuss the structure. In any case, it is advisable for the authors to read a few papers already published in the intended journal and familiarize themselves with the structure of the paper that should be submitted to the intended journal. Check whether they include anything other than

1. Title: The title should be concise, informative, and represent the focus of the research.
2. Abstract: This is a brief summary of the entire paper, including the research question, methodology, key findings, and conclusions.
3. Introduction: The introduction provides context and background information on the research topic. It should clearly state the research question, hypothesis, or objective of the study.
4. Methodology: The methodology describes the research design, experimental setup, data collection methods, and any statistical analyses used. This section should be detailed enough so that other researchers can replicate the study.
5. Results: In this part, the authors present the findings of their research. It should be objective and include all relevant data.
6. Discussion: The discussion interprets the results in the context of the research question. Authors may explain any unexpected results, discuss the implications of their findings, and suggest future research directions.
7. Conclusion: The conclusion summarizes the main outcomes of the study and how they address the research question.
8. References: A list of all the sources cited within the paper, following a specific citation style (e.g., APA, MLA, Chicago, etc.). Check with the journal you intend to send this manuscript.

It is essential for authors to adhere to the specific guidelines provided by the journal they are submitting their work; some papers might include additional sections like Acknowledgments.

I also find that this manuscript is poorly written with little or scant attention paid to collecting data in a scientific manner and presenting and discussing the same. Hence, I cannot recommend this for publication in its present status. However, provided the authors make the necessary corrections the journal may consider publication of the same.

Review report structure

I have not received how the structure of the review report should be from the editors nor any criteria for the reviewer. Since the structure of a review report varies between the journals, (some request the reviewer to number the comments), I will opt for a more informal approach for the benefit of the authors. Since I found a lot of unnecessary information inserted in the manuscript, I have also rephrased a few whole paragraphs with the view of improving the manuscript. All the best.

Topic: Tourists' Activities and their Impacts on Chinhoyi Caves Heritage Site, Zimbabwe

[Why only the impacts of tourists were investigated. There may be an impact by the visitors (locals) and not only the tourists. Please explain].

Abstract:

[The abstract should be precise. I find the abstract vague and poorly written. It should be rephrased to give a clear understanding of the manuscript as shown below and should include the timeline, major positive and negative impacts, and the methodology used to gather the necessary information and any conclusions. Please refer to the rephrased abstract below].

The Chinhoyi Caves, celebrated for their geological and cultural importance, draw a considerable number of tourists annually. This research project examined the diverse activities of these tourists and their effects on the Chinhoyi Caves Heritage Site in Zimbabwe during the period from to The primary objectives of this study were to analyze the types of activities undertaken by tourists, assess their implications on the natural and cultural aspects of the caves, and propose sustainable management approaches for the site. Findings from the study reveal that the increased tourist activities yield both positive and negative impacts, such as Unfortunately, the negative consequences, including, pose potential threats to the conservation and long-term sustainability of the site.

Introduction:

The introduction should be precise. Suggest rewriting the same. Phrases like *"For instance, it is estimated that cruise ships in the Caribbean generate more than 70,000 tons of waste every year. Massive waste can degrade the physical appearance of the water and shoreline and cause the death of marine animals. According to Brevik and Burgess (2013), trekking visitors produce a lot of waste in hill regions. Leave their garbage, oxygen cylinders, and even camping facilities on the trip. Such practices degrade the environment in distant regions with few waste collection or disposal installations, with all the detritus typical of the developed world"* etc. have no relevance to the current topic. You should refrain from including unnecessary details.

I have rephrased it as shown below.

Heritage sites are popular tourist destinations, experiencing increasing visitation (Pederson, 2002). However, this rise in tourists also raises concerns about the need for greater protection as these sites are sensitive and easily damaged by

tourist activities. Tourism generates revenue and draws global attention to the preservation of world heritage sites (Drost, 1996). Nevertheless, the surge in heritage tourism since the 1970s has had detrimental effects on these sites (Ashworth & Tunbridge, 2000). Therefore, sustainable development concepts have emerged as essential considerations to manage destinations, particularly with regard to the environmental and cultural integrity of heritage sites (Drost, 1996). Across the globe, historically significant sites are at risk (Alberts & Hazen, 2019). To address this, UNESCO designed an international agreement to protect natural and cultural sites of exceptional cultural value (UNESCO, 2008). Heritage sites face deterioration due to tourist activities, as evidenced by examples like Venice lagoon and Donostia-San Sebastian city (Harrison & Hitchcock, 2005; Garcia-Hernandez, Calle-Vaquero & Yubero, 2017). Popular heritage sites such as Afghanistan's Bamiyan Valley, Yemen's historic town of Zabi, and Ecuador's Galapagos Islands are also vulnerable (UNESCO, 2008). Different studies have examined various views of tourist activities, ranging from financial perspectives to actions associated with tourism participation (Ciolac, Csoz & Merce, 2011; Rahim et al., 2010; Alejziak, 2013; Hughes, 2011; Biernat, 2011). These activities encompass vandalism, photography, pollution, sightseeing, and collecting historic artifacts (Scot et al., 2007; Berger et al., 2007; Brevik & Burgess, 2013; Lee, 2011). While sightseeing and photography are generally considered sustainable activities, vandalism, pollution, and irresponsible artifact collection pose significant threats to heritage sites (Ateljevic, 2013; Cederholm, 2004; MacCannell, 2011; Historic Artefact Collections Management Policy, 2014; McKinnon, 2015). Hence, Tourists' actions can impact the preservation and long-term sustainability of these valuable cultural and natural sites. This study sought to identify and categorize the diverse tourist activities occurring at Chinhoyi Caves and evaluate their impacts with the view of proposing strategies that can effectively minimize the negative effects of tourist activities on this cherished site.

Research Objectives

1. To establish the various tourist activities at heritage sites; (The study is concentrating on Chinhoyi Caves. Here you are referring to heritage sites. What are the heritage sites mentioned above? You have to be very specific.
2. To assess the impacts of tourist activities on heritage sites; Very broad be specific
3. To suggest strategies that may be adopted to minimize the negative impacts of tourist activities at heritage sites.

I have included these objectives in the introduction itself as per the accepted norms. Therefore, there is no need to include this part.

Methods

An interview guide was designed and administered to fifteen (15) randomly and conveniently selected tourists at the study site who met during the five (5) day data collection period. The same interview guide was administered to five (5) members of staff that work at the heritage site. The staff members were purposefully selected with guides making the majority as they are in constant touch with the tourists. Each interview lasted between 45 minutes and 75 minutes. The interviews were tape-recorded for later transcription verbatim. The interviews were complemented by unplanned observation where the researchers took evidence of tourists' activities at the study site. The observations were recorded in the form of notes and pictures for later use. The twenty interviews were transcribed verbatim and uploaded into

ATLAS.ti 8. The pictures were also uploaded into ATLAS.ti 8. Data was coded in ATLAS to come up with themes that address the objectives of the study.

The methodology is vague and poorly written. Rewrite this. Mention what was in the interview guide. Mention tourist activities were categorized as consumptive land-based activities, non-consumptive land-based activities, consumptive water-based activities and non-consumptive water-based activities. Methodology is one of the most crucial parts in a manuscript.

5. Results and Discussion

This study sought to explore the impacts of tourist activities at heritage sites in Zimbabwe. [Why do you mention the objectives under the results and discussion? The topic concerns Chinhoyi Caves. Here you are mentioning heritage sites in Zimbabwe. This is not acceptable]

The phrase tourist activity is used herein to refer to the total acts and actions of people associated with tourism participation. In order to achieve this main objective three specific objectives were developed [This again is methodology. You cant include methodology in the results and discussion section].

These are i) to establish the various tourist activities at heritage sites [Study concerns on the Chinhoyi caves as per the topic. Why do you mention heritage sites here. You have to be very specific]; ii) to assess the impacts of tourist activities on heritage sites; and iii) to suggest strategies that may be adopted to minimise the negative impacts of tourist activities at heritage sites. Objectives should not be in the results and discussion.

This is mentioned at the bottom of the introduction. No need to mention it again.

5.1. Tourist activities at Heritage Site

A number of activities were carried out by tourists at heritage sites in Zimbabwe. These were summed into four themes; that is consumptive land-based activities, non-consumptive land-based activities, consumptive water-based activities and non-consumptive water-based activities. This is the methodology. Should not include under results.

5.1.1. Consumptive land-based activities

Tourists who visited Chinhoyi Caves engaged in a number of activities that are deemed consumptive in nature as they had the ability to alter the physical environment of the tourist destination and its overall outlook [This again is methodology]The following five statements from research participants sum up the nature of the consumptive activities:

Below should be given in a table like shown. A similar table should be given for water based activities.

The same table should be given for water-based activities. Results should not be hearsay. They should be precise.

I saw people scribbling their names, dates and so on, on rocks, stairs, tree trunks and aloe vera leaves as mementos.

Someone was smoking and they dumped their cigarette stub on the ground.

Some visitors paint colours on rocks and tie pieces of cloth and leave behind clay pots for rituals.

Some people destroy vegetation when they drive on undesignated paths and use twigs to start fires for braai [what is braai]

Some tourists collect rocks, soil and water as specimens for research and as souvenirs.

These are activities that tourists engage in on land that involves harvesting and/or removal of something that alters the original state of the study site. From these activities, some can be perceived as artistic in nature. Art in its broadest sense is a form of communication, it means what the artist wants it to mean, and this meaning is shaped by the materials, techniques, and forms it makes use of, as well as the ideas and feelings it creates in its viewers, it is also an act of expressing feelings, thoughts, and observations (Hauser, 2012). The most common forms of art being done by tourists at Chinhoyi Caves are graffiti, painting and drawing.

According to Bates (2014), graffiti comes from the Italian word graffiare, which means 'to scratch on a surface.' It can be considered as a form of art as indicated by Sequera (2016). Scratching on surfaces is a very common activity at the Chinhoyi caves as revealed by both interviews and observation. Research participants indicated that they either were the ones that participated in graffiti or they saw others doing it or they noticed it on the surface on which it was displayed.

The following picture collage shows evidence of graffiti on a tree trunk and aloe vera plant at the study site.

Figure 1. Evidence of graffiti on tree trunk and aloe vera plant

Drawing is a form of visual art in which a person uses various drawing instruments to mark paper or another two-dimensional medium (Fava, 2011). Drawings can be produced using a wide variety of drawing instruments, including pen and ink, charcoal, chalk, pastels, metalpoint, silverpoint, graphite point, coloured crayons, as well as graver, burin or etching needles for incised types of drawing (Fava, 2011). Drawing is also another form of art done by tourists at the Chinhoyi caves

According to Hauser (2012), painting is the action or skill of using paint, either in a picture or as decoration. Painting can be done using coloured paint or pastels. Painting is a form of art where the artist tries to communicate through art and express his feelings. The researcher managed to gather that painting is also one of the activities done by tourists at the Chinhoyi caves although not very prominent. The activity is not very common due to the requirement of apparatus like paint which under normal circumstances are not permitted to enter the premises. However, some Sangomas are permitted to enter the study site with their pots and apparatus for rituals and are granted access to the caves. It is in such cases that paintings and other forms of drawings are made on the surface as part of cultural traditions or rituals. The painting activity is not very common but it is significant enough to mention because it translates into the traditional significance of the study site. The research participants highlighted that the rituals are done in an effort to appease the ancestral spirits that reside in the Chinhoyi caves. The researcher discovered that the traditional stories and paintings

associated with traditional culture were of interest to the tourists. Hence this art seemed to be adding to the experience at the Chinhoyi Caves as it captivated the tourists. Bright and Porter (2004) posit that consumptive tourist activities require management as there is always a risk of depleting the resource, harassment, associated littering and pollution. However, according to Sequera (2016) acts such as graffiti, painting and drawing may actually interpret how individuals are keen on adding character to a place therefore tourists may draw on surfaces to add to what others will see when they come. Whether or not this has a negative or positive impact might not bother them and all that matters is leaving a mark. These findings are consistent with literature that argues that after visiting a destination tourists always want to leave a mark as a memento (Branscome, 2011). From the research participants' views, it is evident that there was also wilful degradation of natural resources through depletion of resources such as air, water and soil; the destruction of ecosystems; habitat destruction; the extinction of wildlife; and pollution at the Chinhoyi caves. The existence of these activities at the study site supports existing literature. For instance, Burke and Long (2015) stated that some individuals may just kick things like dustbins in parks for no reason and they classified it as an act of vandalism.

First, give the results and then discuss. Please rewrite the whole results and discussion

Conclusion

What are the negative impacts, what are the positive impacts